

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, December 14, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Steve Ela (SE); Kim Huseman (KH); Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Absent: None

Staff: Jared Clark (JC); Andrea Holm (AH)

Agenda

- November 9, 2021 notes
- Excluded Methods Spring 2022 (MJ/LP) - Discuss review
- Tall oil, distilled (WT) - Discuss review
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **November 9, 2021 notes** were reviewed, updated, and accepted.
- **Excluded Methods Spring 2022 (MJ/LP)** - One of the leads discussed the scope of the next document. Members discussed the process for adding a discussion document and TBD definition proposals to the open docket. Members discussed draft definitions for some TBD terms. MS will discuss this again on the next call.
- **Tall oil, distilled (WT)** - The lead has additional comments to consider, topic bumped to the next call.
- **Additional Items** - None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

November 9, 2021

Technical Reports

Work Agenda

Excluded Methods

Tall oil, distilled - Update

Research priorities

December 14, 2021

Excluded Methods Spring 2022 (MJ/LP) - Discuss

Tall oil, distilled (WT) - Discuss review

January 11, 2022 - last call before RPs from HS, CS, LS are due to MS

Tall oil, distilled (WT) - Discuss/vote on proposal

Excluded Methods Spring 2022 (MJ/LP) - Discuss

February 08, 2022

Research Priorities (WT) - Discuss/vote on disc doc

March 08, 2022

April 12, 2022

May 10, 2022

June 14, 2022

July 12, 2022

August 09, 2022
 September 13, 2022
 October 11, 2022
 November 08, 2022
 December 13, 2022

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled, Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	N/A	WT	Discussion Document (Spr 2022) Proposal (Fall 2022)	May 2012 Framework Proposal <u>Subcommittee reps to MS:</u> Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): SE Livestock (LS): KH RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS on 1.25.22	11.9.21 TBD	Spr 2022
Petition and Technical Report (TR) tracking: Update to TR template	N/A	NOP		Ongoing	11.9.21	N/A
Excluded Methods Spring 2022	N/A	MJ/LP	Discussion Document, Proposal		11.9.21 12.14.21 1.11.22	Spr 2022
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	Proposal	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21.	11.10.20 12.8.20 10.12.21 12.14.21 1.11.22	Spr 2022

Milestones

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 12, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, November 09, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Logan Petrey (LP); Steve Ela (SE)

Absent: Brian Caldwell (BC)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Andrea Holm (AH)

Agenda

- Review October 12th, 2021 notes
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **October 12th, 2021 notes** were accepted as written
- **Additional Items**
 - **Technical Reports** - Members discussed the TR template and possible revisions for consistency in information regarding excluded methods. The NOP provided guidance on how the MS would go about making revisions. Since the templates are a tool for the NOSB, the Subcommittee can work on it without requesting a work agenda item. The NOP also highlighted that the petition and TR templates are not aligned and that could be included in this update. The MS will discuss this again at the next call.
 - **Work Agenda** - The MS Chair discussed work agenda items and the deadline for drafting the Spring 2022 research priorities discussion document.
 - **Excluded Methods** - The MS Vice Chair discussed excluded methods and would like to develop a proposal or discussion document for every NOSB meeting. For the next document, the lead would like to move forward with a proposal regarding some of the TBD planting breeding techniques (cell and protoplast fusion). The lead asked for assistance from other Subcommittee members with TBD definitions. MS will discuss this again on the next call.
 - **Tall Oil petition and proposal** - The MS Chair will bring a draft proposal for discussion at the Jan 11 call.
 - **Research Priorities:** The MS Chair discussed the research priorities discussion document for Spring 2022 and will send the previous version to the Subcommittee chairs for reference.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

October 12, 2021

Tall oil, distilled (WT) - TR sufficiency

November 9, 2021

Technical Reports

Work Agenda

Excluded Methods

Tall oil, distilled (WT) - Discuss

Research Priorities

December 14, 2021
 Excluded Methods Spring 2022 - Discuss
 Tall oil, distilled (WT) - Proposal discussion and vote
 January 11, 2022
 February 08, 2022
 Research Priorities (WT) - Discuss/vote on disc doc
 March 08, 2022
 April 12, 2022
 May 10, 2022
 June 14, 2022
 July 12, 2022
 August 09, 2022
 September 13, 2022
 October 11, 2022
 November 08, 2022
 December 13, 2022

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities May 2012 Framework Proposal Discussion document - Spr 2022 Proposal - Fall 2022	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): SE Livestock (LS): KH RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS on 1.25.22	11.9.21 TBD	Spr 2022
Petition and TR tracking - Update to TR template	NOP	Ongoing	11.9.21	N/A
Excluded Methods Spring 2022 Proposal	MJ/LP		11.9.21 12.14.21	Spr 2022
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (\$§ 205.601, 205.603) Proposal	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid- Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21.	11.10.20 12.8.20 10.12.21 1.11.21	Spr 2022

Milestones

Spring 2022 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 12, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2022 proposals due to NOP	Feb 16, 2022
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2022 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2022
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2022
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2022
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 4, 2022
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 21, 2022
Spring 2022 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 26 - 28, 2022
Final recommendations due	May 27, 2022

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, October 12, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH); Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: Steve Ela (SE); Brian Caldwell (BC)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review August 12, 2021 notes
- Tall oil, distilled (WT) - TR sufficiency
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 12, 2021 notes** were approved via email September 20, 2021
- **Tall oil, distilled (WT).** The lead discussed the TR for tall oil, noting that the content of the document is adequate to address the difference between distilled tall oil and crude tall oil. The TR was found sufficient.
- **Additional items.** The Chair noted some questions regarding copper in the Research Priorities document.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

August 12, 2021 at 2:00 ET/11:00 PT (note date change)

Research priorities (All) - Discuss/vote

Excluded Methods Fall 2021 - Discuss/vote

September 14, 2021 - cancelled

October 12, 2021

Tall oil, distilled (WT) - TR sufficiency

November 9, 2021

December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities May 2012 Framework Proposal Discussion document - Spr 2021 Proposal - Fall 2021	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	8.12.21	Fall 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods Fall 2021 Discussion document	MJ/LP		6.8.21 7.13.21 7.27.21 8.12.21	Fall 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Proposal	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid- Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21.	11.10.20 12.8.20 10.12.21	Spr 2022

*Discussed. *Voted

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Thursday, August 12, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Brian Caldwell (BC); Kim Huseman (KH); Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review July 27, 2021 notes
- Research priorities (All) - Discuss/vote
- Excluded Methods Fall 2021 - Discuss/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 27, 2021** were accepted as written
- **Research priorities Fall 2021 (All).** The lead briefly presented the current proposal and the MS moved to a vote.

Motion to accept the Fall 2021 research priorities proposal

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded Methods Fall 2021 discussion document (MJ).** The group discussed the draft document, the TBD list, and a lingering question about cell fusion and the 2013 NOP Policy Memo 13-1. After suggestions for modifications, the MS moved to a vote on the agreed upon changes as discussed.

Motion to accept the Fall 2021 excluded methods discussion document

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Additional items.** The MS deferred the review of tall oil as they are waiting for the technical report. See table below.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

July 27, 2021

Excluded Methods Fall 2021

August 12, 2021 at 2:00 ET/11:00 PT (note date change)

Research priorities (All) - Discuss/vote

Excluded Methods Fall 2021 - Discuss/vote

September 14, 2021

Tall oil, distilled (WT) - TR sufficiency (Pending TR)

October 12, 2021

November 9, 2021

December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities May 2012 Framework Proposal Discussion document - Spr 2021 Proposal - Fall 2021	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	8.12.21	Fall 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods Fall 2021 Discussion document	MJ/LP		6.8.21 7.13.21 7.27.21 8.12.21	Fall 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Proposal	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid- Aug.	11.10.20 12.8.20 9.14.21	Spr 2022

*Discussed. *Voted

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes

Tuesday, July 27, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Brian Caldwell (BC); Kim Huseman (KH); Logan Petrey (LP); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review July 13, 2021 notes
- Excluded Methods Fall 2021 (MJ)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 13, 2021** notes were accepted with modifications to replace the phrase “loophole in the regulations” when referring to the commercial availability clause.
- **Excluded Methods Fall 2021 (MJ).** The lead summarized the conversation from the last Subcommittee call. The group discussed three potential areas to focus on (protoplast, cell fusion, and eco-tilling), and how to move forward. A member and NOP noted that cell fusion is specified in OFPA as an example of an excluded method and discussed how that relates to the NOP policy memo regarding cell fusion, which was published shortly before the GMO ad hoc Subcommittee was formed. Members discussed how or if they could address or update the policy memo. The MS is grappling with the question of what the future of organic plant breeding looks like. The MS chose to put forth a discussion document posing questions for public comment.
- **Additional items.** The MS Rescheduled August meeting to August 12 instead of August 10.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

July 13, 2021

Excluded Methods Fall 2021 (MJ)

July 27, 2021

Excluded Methods Fall 2021

August 12, 2021 at 2:00 ET/11:00 PT

Research priorities (All) - Vote on proposal

Excluded Methods Fall 2021 - Discuss/vote

Tall oil, distilled (WT) - TR sufficiency (Pending TR)

September 14, 2021

October 12, 2021

November 9, 2021

December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities discussion doc May 2012 Framework Proposal	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	8.10.21	Fall 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods Fall 2021	MJ/LP		6.8.21 7.13.21 7.27.21 8.10.21	Fall 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603)	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due late July.	11.10.20 12.8.20 8.10.21	Fall 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, July 13, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Brian Caldwell (BC); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer

Absent: Kim Huseman (KH); Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Guests: Jason Cavatorta (Earthworks Seeds), Adrienne Shelton (Vitalis Organics)

Agenda

- Review June 8, 2021 notes
- Excluded Methods Fall 2021 (MJ)/Guest speakers
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 8, 2021** notes were accepted as written.
- **Excluded Methods Fall 2021 (MJ)/Guest speakers.** Adrienne Shelton (Vitalis Organics) and Jason Cavatorta (Earthworks Seeds) joined the MS call to discuss seed breeding and excluded methods. The group discussed methods that are allowed as well as excluded in organic agriculture, and discussed specific methods on the TBD list in the MS's Excluded Methods proposal. The group also discussed the market forces driving the industry of seed breeding, and how to address the commercial availability clause that allows non-organic seed on organic farms.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

June 8, 2021

July 13, 2021

Excluded Methods Fall 2021 (MJ)

July 27, 2021

Excluded Methods Fall 2021

August 10, 2021

Research priorities (All) - Vote on proposal

Tall oil, distilled (WT) - TR sufficiency (Pending TR)

September 14, 2021

October 12, 2021

November 9, 2021

December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities discussion doc May 2012 Framework Proposal	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	8.10.21	Fall 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods Fall 2021	MJ/LP		6.8.21 7.13.21 7.27.21	Fall 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Proposal?	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due late July.	11.10.20 12.8.20 8.10.21	Fall 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, June 8, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Kim Huseman (KH); Brian Caldwell (BC); Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review May 11, 2021 notes
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Excluded Methods Fall 2021 workstream discussion (MJ)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 11, 2021** notes accepted as written.
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP)**
 - NOP recently received two TRs that will be reviewed and sent to the Crops Subcommittee soon: magnesium oxide and ozone.
 - Several TRs are in development and are expected soon: Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) (Handling), kaolin pectic (Livestock), phosphoric acid - petitioned (Handling), and tall oil - petitioned (Materials).
 - There are several petitions under review by the Subcommittees, and no new ones in the queue at the moment.
- **Excluded Methods Fall 2021 workstream discussion (MJ).** The group discussed the topic of excluded methods, in particular as it relates to seeds and plant breeding. Members discussed the possibility of hosting a panel, and perhaps inviting several guests from the seed community to Materials Subcommittee call(s) over the summer. The lead will continue to work on definitions on the TBD list in the draft document, and will reach out to potential guest speakers.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

May 11, 2021

June 8, 2021

July 13, 2021

Tall oil, distilled - TR sufficiency (Pending TR)

August 10, 2021

Research priorities - Vote on proposal

September 14, 2021

October 12, 2021

November 9, 2021

December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities discussion doc May 2012 Framework Proposal	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	8.10.21	Fall 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods Fall 2021	MJ/LP		6.8.21 7.13.21	Fall 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Proposal?	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due late July.	11.10.20 12.8.20 7.13.21	Fall 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 3, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, May 11, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Kim Huseman (KH); Brian Caldwell (BC); Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review April 13, 2021 notes
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Debrief from April 2021 NOSB meeting
- Assign discussion dates for work agenda items
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 13, 2021 notes** were approved as written.
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP)**
 - TRs for magnesium oxide and ozone are under revision and should be ready in June.
 - TR requests for 2024 sunsets are due to NOP in mid-June. Subcommittees are scheduled to discuss the need for TRs on the May 18 calls.
 - The TRs for distilled tall oil and phosphoric acid are due back in early July.
- **Debrief from April 2021 NOSB meeting**
 - The MS Chair noted that the public comments for the research priorities were interesting and robust. He will synthesize the comments and send them to the Subcommittee Chairs for consideration.
 - Excluded Methods. Commenters urged the NOSB to complete the to-be-determined (TBD) list, and to address issues on organic seed. The group discussed comments about the outstanding organic seed guidance documents (from Fall 2018 and Spring 2019). Currently there are three outstanding recommendations on seed and LP will review the three recommendations and summarize for the group.
- **Assign discussion dates for work agenda items.** See table below.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

April 13, 2021

Review public comments

Prep for Spring NOSB meeting

May 11, 2021

June 8, 2021

July 13, 2021

Tall oil, distilled - TR sufficiency
 August 10, 2021
 Research priorities - Vote on proposal
 September 14, 2021
 October 12, 2021
 November 9, 2021
 December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities discussion doc May 2012 Framework Proposal	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	8.10.21	Fall 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods Fall 2021	MJ/LP	Discussion document	6.8.21	Fall 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Proposal	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due July.	11.10.20 12.8.20 7.13.21	Fall 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Fall 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 14, 2021
NOSB Request for TRs for 2024 sunset materials	Jun 18, 2021
NOP - Draft Fall 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Jul 30, 2021
NOSB - Fall 2021 proposals due to NOP	Aug 13, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 1, 2021
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Sep 21, 2021
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 4, 2021
Public comment webinars	Oct 12 & 14, 2021
Fall 2021 NOSB meeting - Sacramento, CA	Oct 19 - 21, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, April 13, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Kim Huseman (KH); Brian Caldwell (BC);

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Review public comments
- Prep for Spring NOSB meeting
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).**
 - Two new petitions: peroxy-lactic acid ("PLA") in Handling, and carbon dioxide in Crops
 - There are a few TRs in development.
 - NOP returned two TRs for edits: cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) in Handling, and kaolin pectin for Livestock.
 - TRs for magnesium oxide and ozone (both for Crops) are due soon
 - TRs for phosphoric acid (Handling) and distilled tall oil (Materials) are due in July.
- **Review public comments/ Prep for Spring NOSB meeting**
 - The group discussed the process for reviewing comments and presenting substances at the Spring meeting.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

March 9, 2021 - cancelled

April 13, 2021

Review public comments

Prep for Spring NOSB meeting

May 11, 2021

June 8, 2021

July 13, 2021

August 10, 2021

September 14, 2021

October 12, 2021

November 9, 2021

December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities discussion doc May 2012 Framework Proposal	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	2.9.21	Spr 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods discussion doc	MJ		11.10.20 12.8.20 1.12.21 2.9.21	Spr 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Proposal	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due July.	11.10.20 12.8.20 TBD	Fall 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 18, 2021
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	Feb 3 - 5, 2021
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Virtual	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, February 9, 2021 1:00 pm ET draft

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Kim Huseman (KH); Brian Caldwell (BC); Logan Petrey (LP); Carolyn Dimitri (CD) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review January 12 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote
- Excluded Methods (MJ) - discuss draft discussion doc/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 12 meeting notes** were accepted as written.
- **TR and Materials Update (NOP).**
 - The Crops Subcommittee just received a new petition for carbon dioxide.
 - The Biochar TR was returned to the writer with some additional questions from Crops.
 - Cetylpyridinium chloride (CPC) TR was sent to HS recently for review.
 - The TR for kasugamycin was found sufficient by Crops.
 - NOP is waiting for bids for TRs for two petitions: Tall oil and phosphoric acid.
 - The NOP will send out for bid soon the hydronium petition.
 - The HS found the TR for zein sufficient.
 - The TR for kaolin pectin is in development and is due back at end of March.
- **Research Priorities (All).** The lead circulated a draft document for the Research Priorities and outlined the Board process for the new members. The group discussed the current list. The lead will make some modifications based on the conversation and recirculate for an email vote.

Motion to accept the discussion document on NOSB research priorities 2021

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: SE

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Excluded Methods (MJ).** The lead identified changes that were made to the draft document after the last call, and the group discussed them. The lead will update the appendix to include the prior NOSB recommendation instead of the Subcommittee version and will submit the document for the Spring meeting.

Motion to accept the discussion document on Excluded Methods, as amended with the updated appendices

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Additional items. Members discussed the difference between discussion documents and proposals, and the process by which the NOSB gathers feedback from stakeholders prior to each meeting.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

January 12, 2021

Excluded Methods - Discuss draft discussion doc

February 9, 2021

Excluded Methods (MJ) - Discuss draft discussion doc/vote

March 9, 2021

April 13, 2021

May 11, 2021

June 8, 2021

July 13, 2021

August 10, 2021

September 14, 2021

October 12, 2021

November 9, 2021

December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities discussion doc May 2012 Framework Proposal	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	2.9.21	Spr 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods discussion doc	MJ		11.10.20 12.8.20 1.12.21 2.9.21	Spr 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Proposal	WT	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR.	11.10.20 12.8.20 TBD	Fall 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, January 12, 2021 1:00 pm ET

Attendees: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ), Vice Chair; Emily Oakley (EO); Dan Seitz (DS); Steve Ela (SE); Kim Huseman (KH); Brian Caldwell (BC) - observer

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review December 8 meeting notes (All)
- TR and Materials Update (NOP)
- Excluded Methods - discuss draft discussion doc
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 8 meeting notes** were accepted as written.
- **Technical Reports (TRs) and Materials Update (NOP)**
 - The Ammonia extract TR is under review by NOP.
 - The TRs for Kasugamycin and Zein should be back in the next couple of weeks.
 - The TRs for three sunset substances are expected soon: activated charcoal, kaolin pectin, and mineral oil. NOP will complete the initial review.
 - The TRs for tall oil and phosphoric acid will be contracted soon.
- **Excluded Methods.** The lead summarized the draft discussion document including the issue of co-existence, emphasizing that the Organic Regulations explicitly prohibit excluded methods. The draft document contains a history of the NOSB work to date, and several questions for public comment. Members discussed the questions and offered feedback, including the question of how far back in the supply chain the NOSB should consider when conducting reviews. A member added support for the document and highlighted that the Board strives to work with the industry and community to protect the organic system of agriculture. The NOP shared NOP policy memo 11-13 which addresses genetically modified organisms. The lead will modify the draft document and the MS will discuss it and vote on the next call.
- **Additional items.** Dan Seitz said farewell to the Materials Subcommittee members, as this is his last meeting, and commended everyone for their work on the Excluded Methods project.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET)

December 8, 2020

Tall Oil, distilled (WT/EO) - Petition sufficiency

January 12, 2021

Excluded Methods - Discuss draft discussion doc

February 9, 2021

Excluded Methods - Discuss draft discussion doc/Vote

Tall Oil, distilled (WT/EO) - Discuss Petition discussion doc/Vote

March 9, 2021

April 13, 2021

May 11, 2021
 June 8, 2021
 July 13, 2021
 August 10, 2021
 September 14, 2021
 October 12, 2021
 November 9, 2021
 December 14, 2021

Work Agenda

Materials/GMO Project	Contact	Notes	Discussion, Voted	Target meeting
Research Priorities discussion doc May 2012 Framework Proposal	WT	Subcommittee reps to MS KH - Livestock SE - Crops WT - Handling RPs from Subcomms due to MS in Jan	2.9.21	Spr 2021
Petition and TR tracking	NOP	Ongoing	N/A	N/A
Excluded Methods discussion doc	MJ		11.10.20 12.8.20 1.12.21 2.9.21	Spr 2021
Tall oil, distilled 2008 petition for distilled tall oil (§§ 205.601, 205.603) Pet. discussion doc	WT/EO	2010 TR Tall Oil Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition sufficiency due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR.	11.10.20 12.8.20 2.9.21	Spr 2021

*Discussed. *Voted

Spring 2021 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2020
NOSB - Spring 2021 proposals due to NOP	Feb 18, 2021
New NOSB member training	TBD
NOP - Draft Spring 2021 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 2, 2021
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2021
Public comment closes	Apr 1, 2021
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 6, 2021
Public comment webinars	Apr 20 & 22, 2021
Spring 2021 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - 30, 2021