National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, January 13, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jay Feldman (JFe); Jennifer Taylor (JT); Harold Austin (HA); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in

Absent: Nick Maravell (NM); Wendy Fulwider (WF) Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

Work agenda Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals	JFe/ JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS	08 26 14	Fall 2015
May 2012 Framework Proposal				
		CW - LS		
		ZS - CS		
		<mark>ZS - HS</mark>		
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc		TBD?
		will be incorporated into		
		"Prevention Strategies for		
		Excluded Methods in Crops and		
		Handling" doc		
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc	08 26 14	Spr 2015
				6
Prevention Strategy Guidance	FT/ZS	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing		Spr 2015
for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling		paper to NOP requesting this is placed on the work agenda. NOP		
		sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to		
		addition		

Work agenda

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve December 9, 2014 notes
- Discuss Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document (FT)
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Spring Fall Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes from December 9, 2014 were approved with no changes.
- **Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document** The NOP suggested a minor change to the introduction regarding the purpose of document since this is a discussion document and not a proposal. Members made minor edits to the document including the questions for public comment. The lead will incorporate the changes and the MS will vote on the document during the next call.
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug.
 - CW noted that once he rotates off the Board he is willing to provide acreage for those wishing to conduct (seed research)?
 - HA gave a presentation to a grower group last week consisting of crop producers and handlers, where he discussed the sunset review process and explained how stakeholders could be more active in the organic process.
- Seed purity panel. A member asked about the NOP determination on the request to hold a panel on seed purity at the spring 2015 NOSB meeting. The same member noted that in addition to valuable input, holding a panel would also add a bit of diversity to the meeting agenda in which they are reviewing a large number of sunset materials. The NOP will follow up with the Deputy Administrator and report back to the MS.
- NOP Job Opening. The NOP asked that the Subcommittee members pass along the information about the newly released job announcement for the Director of Standards, which closes at the end of January.
- Spring/Fall Milestones Update Note table below for due dates.
- Next meeting dates. February 10 is last meeting before the proposal deadline.
- The meeting was adjourned.

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule:

December 9, 2014 1:00 ET

January 13, 2015 1:00 ET

February 10, 2015 1:00 ET

Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document - Complete discussion and vote.

March 10, 2015 1:00 ET April 14, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, February 10, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair; Harold Austin (HA); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Francis Thicke (FT); Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Jennifer Taylor (JT); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in Absent: Nick Maravell (NM) Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda				
Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS		Fall 2015
		CW - LS		
		ZS - CS		
		ZS - HS		
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	TBD
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc - will post same doc as last meeting	08 26 14	Spr 2015
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this is placed on the work agenda. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition	02 10 15	Spr 2015

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve January 13, 2015 notes
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group (BR)?
- Material TR update (LB)
- Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document (ZS/FT)
- Seed Expert Panel (ZS)
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (ALL)
- Spring Fall Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes from January 13, 2015 approved with no changes
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group (BR)
 - Research priorities BR is currently compiling an update for the MS about the past NOSB research priorities and noted that there are many pieces and it is very complex. There are a couple of USDA entities that are reviewing and compiling these data. She will brief the MS when it is completed.
 - Mat Ngouajio of NIFA will participate as a guest speaker at the spring 2015 NOSB meeting to talk about research priorities and funding.
 - The USDA is hosting a webinar/listening session on coexistence for invited stakeholders March 12 and 13. It will be followed by a public webinar and public comment period as well. BR noted that it will be similar and complementary to the seed integrity panel the NOSB will host at the spring NOSB meeting.
 - The Organic Producer survey was sent out recently and BR urged folks to spread the word so there is widespread participation. The deadline to submit online is the end of March, while paper copies must be mailed in by Friday February 13. Community feedback about the website indicated that it is not working well and folks are having trouble submitting comments. BR mentioned a helpline number folks can call for assistance.
- Materials TR update (LB) The most recent material's spreadsheet was sent to the NOSB last week and there are several draft TRs under review that will be sent to the Subcommittees soon.
- **Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document** (ZS/FT). The group discussed the suggestions and edits that the NOP provided. Members also discussed the questions that will be included in the proposal and moved to a vote.

Motion to accept the Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document Motion by: FT Seconded by: ZS Additional Discussion: none Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

• Seed Expert Panel (ZS). The members discussed the proposed list of panelists that was circulated in December. The MS will discuss the details of the panel later this week with the

Deputy Administrator, and are hoping to select 3 - 4 people to participate in a panel at the spring 2015 meeting. The panel will include prepared questions as well as time for open questions and answers from the Board. The lead requested that the members send their list of potential questions, which they will discuss on the next call.

- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (ALL) deferred to next call
- Spring Fall Milestones update see below
- Next Meeting Dates see below for expanded list
- The meeting was adjourned.

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule: January 13, 2015 1:00 ET February 10, 2015 1:00 ET Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document - Complete discussion and vote. March 10, 2015 1:00 ET **Discuss questions for Seed Panel** April 14, 2015 1:00 ET May 12, 2015 1:00 ET June 9, 2015 1:00 ET July 14, 2015 1:00 ET August 11, 2015 1:00 ET September 8, 2015 1:00 ET October 13, 2015 1:00 ET November 10, 2015 1:00 ET December 8, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, March 10, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Harold Austin (HA); Jennifer Taylor (JT); Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo) Absent: Nick Maravell (NM) Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda				
Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS		Fall 2015
ividy 2012 Framework Proposal		CW - LS		
		ZS - CS		
		ZS - HS		
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	TBD
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc - will post same doc as last meeting	08 26 14	Spr 2015
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this is placed on the work agenda. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition	02 10 15	Spr 2015

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve February 10, 2015 notes
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group (BR)?
- Material TR update (LB)
- Seed Panel (ZS) Logistics, confirmation of panelists, discuss questions
- La Jolla MS Presentations/Fall Work Plan Preparation
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (ALL)
- Spring/Fall Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes from February 10, 2015 notes were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable Working Group** (BR). CW thanked BR for keeping the Board informed about Organic Research at USDA.
 - National Institute of Food and Agriculture Organic Agriculture Research and Extension Initiative (NIFA/OREI) call for grant proposals was just published and BR forwarded the link to the group. Board members met with NIFA reps in February and had a useful discussion about NOSB Research Priorities.
 - The workshop on co-existence is coming up and ZS is participating. BR will send the details about how to participate in the webinar.
 - Farm Service Agency pilot outreach project is underway. The Farm Service has a large number of field offices in Minnesota, which is where the project is being piloted. The goal is to provide information at the producer level on how to transition to organic.
 - CW noted that he will reach out to other NOSB members about potential funding opportunities via his University.
- Materials Update (LB). The monthly materials report is currently being updated. LB noted that she is waiting for several TRs that will likely be sent to the Subcommittees soon, which they then can approve and get posted before the proposal comment deadline. A member asked about the TR for Laminarin, which LB noted was delayed to prioritize 2017 sunset materials.
- Seed Panel (ZS) The panel will be 90 minutes long, is scheduled for Thursday April 30, and consists of four panelists. The MS members discussed questions for the panelists. The group will limit the number of prepared questions to 5, and will provide those to each of the panelists in advance
- La Jolla MS Presentations/Fall Work Plan Preparation. There are two spring 2015 discussion documents that will become fall 201 5proposals, and the MS will also have a Research Priorities proposal.
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (ALL) deferred
- Spring/Fall Milestones Update see table below
- Next Meeting Dates see list below
- The meeting was adjourned

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule:

February 10, 2015 1:00 ET
Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods Discussion Document - Complete discussion and vote.
March 10, 2015 1:00 ET
Discuss questions for Seed Panel
April 14, 2015 1:00 ET
Discuss public comments
May 12, 2015 1:00 ET
June 9, 2015 1:00 ET
July 14, 2015 1:00 ET
July 14, 2015 1:00 ET
September 8, 2015 1:00 ET
October 13, 2015 1:00 ET
November 10, 2015 1:00 ET
December 8, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, April 14, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Harold Austin (HA); Jennifer Taylor (JT); Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo)
Absent: Nick Maravell (NM); Lisa Brines (LB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Devon Pattillo (DP), Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda				
Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals	JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS		Fall 2015
May 2012 Framework Proposal		CW - LS		
		ZS - CS		
		ZS - HS		
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	TBD
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Discussion Doc - will post same doc as last meeting	08 26 14	Spr 2015
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Discussion doc. ZS Wrote briefing paper to NOP requesting this is placed on the work agenda. NOP sent memo 04 28 14 agreeing to addition	02 10 15	Spr 2015

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

Agenda

- Roll Call (MA)
- Approve March 10, 2015 notes
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group (BR)
- Material TR update (DP)
- Discuss public comments Excluded Method Document
- Public Comments GMO Prevention Strategies
- Discuss seed panel (ZS)
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (ALL)
- Spring/Fall Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion:

- Notes from March 10, 2015 notes were approved with no changes
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group (BR). Requests for National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) grants are out and the deadline is soon. The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS) is holding 3 webinars about biotechnology and section 7CFR Part 340 of the organic regulation; May 6, 12, and 20. BR will forward the link to the MS. A written comment period will likely follow the webinar. The MS would like to submit comments to the open public comment period for APHIS. BR will forward the comment period dates, and ZS will discuss this first on the next Executive call, and then ask the NOP if it is feasible to add this to the MS work agenda.
- Material Update on Technical Reports (DP). The NOP is expecting several TRs: Laminarin, Aluminum Sulfate, Sodium Bisulfate, paraciticides, and Whey Protein Concentrate. The NOSB has received several new petitions: Sulfuric Acid (micronutrient use), Anaerobic Digestates, and Ash from Manure burning. The May materials report will be sent after the NOSB meeting.
- **Public comments.** The NOSB received extensive comments from stakeholders about the Excluded Method Document, which the MS found very helpful. The lead will summarize the comments at the NOSB meeting. The Board received several on the seed panel, and few comments about the GMO Prevention Strategies guidance.
- Seed panel (ZS). ZS, as point-of-contact for the panelists, has provided them with some preparatory questions from the MS members.
- **Prevention Strategy Guidance (FT).** The lead noted that the comments were comprehensive and helpful. Stakeholders are pleased that the NOSB is discussing this and urged the NOSB to not move too quickly. A member noted that the version of the prevention strategy guidance doc that was sent to the program for posting was not the final version and would like to make sure that point is emphasized at the meeting.
- **Organic Bug or Organic Hug (ALL).** The MS Chair commented about the drought in CA, which is severe and affects the rest of agriculture.
- Spring/Fall Milestones Update. See below
- Next Meeting Dates. See below
- The meeting was adjourned

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule: March 10, 2015 1:00 ET Discuss questions for Seed Panel April 14, 2015 1:00 ET Discuss public comments May 12, 2015 1:00 ET June 9, 2015 1:00 ET July 14, 2015 1:00 ET

August 11, 2015 1:00 ET September 8, 2015 1:00 ET October 13, 2015 1:00 ET November 10, 2015 1:00 ET December 8, 2015 1:00 ET

Spring 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOSB Training	Feb 4-5, 2015
NOP - Complete Spring 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2015
NOSB - Spring 2015 proposals due to NOP	Feb 25, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 9, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 13, 2015
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before spring mtg)	Apr 10, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 13, 2015
Spring 2015 NOSB meeting - La Jolla, CA	Week of April 27 - 30

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, May 12, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Jennifer Taylor (JT); Francis Thicke (FT)

Absent: Colehour Bondera (CBo); Nick Maravell (NM), Harold Austin (HA) Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Betsy Rakola (BR)

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS		Fall 2015
IVIAY 2012 FIAILIEWOIK PIOPOSAL		CW - LS		
		ZS - CS		
		ZS - HS		
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Proposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	Fall 2015
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal?		Fall 2015
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Proposal		Fall 2015

Work agenda

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

- Roll call
- Approve April 14, 2015 notes

- Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update (BR)
- Material TR update (LB)
- Seed Panel Summary The Next Step
- Fall Work Plan Items
 - APHIS Stakeholder Engagement Biotechnology Reg. (PART 340)
 - Research Priorities Proposal
 - Prevention Strategies Proposal
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (ALL)
- Fall 2015 Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- The meeting was adjourned

Discussion

- Roll Call (MA)
- Notes from April 14, 2015 were not yet available for review
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update (BR).
 - NRCS is hosting a webinar series about the environmental benefits of organic agriculture including mitigating climate change, and soil and water quality. The next two webinars will be held May 21st and June 17th.
 - As discussed on the last call, APHIS is holding two more webinars this month on biotechnology: May 12 and May 20. APHIS is seeking comments on part 340 of the regulations, which pertain to Genetic

Engineering. http://www.aphis.usda.gov/APHISVirtualMeetings/

- **Material TRs update** (LB). The NOP sent a new materials report to the NOSB last week. Several TRs should be ready soon: revisions to the TR for Enzymes and two TRs for Livestock materials.
- Seed Panel Summary Next Steps. The group spoke briefly about the panel presentations, which the entire group felt were very well done and helpful. The presentations are posted on the meetings webpage.
- Fall Work Plan Items
 - APHIS Stakeholder Engagement Biotechnology Reg. (PART 340). The MS/NOSB members, as individuals, are encouraged to submit comments based on conversations they will have on the next MS call. APHIS had posed 4 specific questions. BR added that APHIS asked about legal authorities given to USDA and that the Plant Protection Act has governed USDA's biotechnology regulations.
 - Research Priorities Proposal (JT). The lead asked about the status of the research priorities from 2014. BR noted that NOP, through OWG, shares the research priorities with research agencies at the Agricultural Research Service (ARS) and the National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA). The NOSB priorities were cited in NIFAs last call for proposals. BR mentioned that long lists of priorities often cannot be incorporated into requests for proposals, and that research agencies find focused and targeted lists most useful. A member asked about priorities that emanate mostly from the Handling Subcommittee regarding food science and/or ingredients research priorities. She noted that these don't fit well within NIFA or ARS, and asked of there were other venues better suited. BR will seek information about this. The Lead will send out a formal request to the other Subcommittees to start formulating ideas and suggestions for the fall submission.

- Prevention Strategies Proposal (FT). The group discussed the comments received at NOSB meeting, the majority of which focused on thresholds. The MS will use that information to formulate the next iteration of the document. A member asked about separating this topic into two documents: One to be put forth as a discussion document on thresholds and one as a proposal.
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug (ALL)
 - The members wished Harold Austin a speedy recovery and hoped he would be back with us soon.
 - CW let the group know that he recently sent an email to them regarding funding opportunities at the land grant institutions.
 - ZS met with the Dean at UC Davis and the head of the CA Department of Food and Agriculture, and both entities expressed interest in hearing from the NOSB and about their research priorities.
 - BR noted that she has been working with e-Organic group and they too have expressed an interest in working with the land grant institutions. She suggested that the NOSB coordinate with them.
 - FT noted that he received call from his senator in Iowa and accompanied her on a farm tour.
- Fall 2015 Milestones Update. See new table below.
- Next Meeting Dates. See below
- Adjourn

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule: April 14, 2015 1:00 ET Discuss public comments May 12, 2015 1:00 ET June 9, 2015 1:00 ET July 14, 2015 1:00 ET August 11, 2015 1:00 ET September 8, 2015 1:00 ET November 10, 2015 1:00 ET December 8, 2015 1:00 ET

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015

Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, June 9, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Jennifer Taylor (JT); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in
Absent: Nick Maravell (NM), Harold Austin (HA)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda				
Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS		Fall 2015
		CW - LS		
		ZS - CS		
		ZS - HS		
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Proposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	Fall 2015
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal?		Fall 2015
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Proposal		Fall 2015

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

- Roll call
- Approve April 14, 2015 notes

- Approve May 12, 2015 notes
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update (BR)
- Material TR update (LB)
- Update: APHIS Stakeholder Engagement Biotechnology Reg. (PART 340)
- Fall Work Plan Items
 - Research Priorities Proposal
 - o Prevention Strategies Proposal
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Fall 2015 Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion

- Notes of April 14, 2015 were approved as is
- Notes of May 12, 2015 were approved as is
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update (BR).
 - NRCS is holding webinars to promote its call for applications for the Regional Conservation Partnership Program (RCPP) which is a national, regional, and state level program.
 - A member followed up on a previous request for resources regarding research topics focused on handling/materials. She noted that NIFA and NRCS don't support these types of research areas. BR is waiting for feedback from the Organic Working Group.
- Material TR update (LB). The NOP recently circulated the June materials update and LB noted the outstanding petitions and TRs. The TR requests for 2018 sunset materials are due at the end of July. A member asked about the materials for reclassification and the need for limited scope TRs. The NOP said the Subcommittee can submit requests for additional TRs, but the reports are unlikely to be completed by fall 2015. If additional action is needed (e.g., reclassification), it can be completed at a later meeting separate from the sunset review.
- Update: Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS) Stakeholder Engagement Biotechnology Reg. (PART 340). ZS urged the members to submit comments by the June 22 deadline. To date, APHIS has not received many comments. Since the NOSB cannot submit comments as a group, ZS offered to provide members with background information and draft comments so they can write individual comments for submission.
- Fall Work Plan Items
 - Research Priorities Proposal. Each of the Subcommittee liaisons has discussed this on conference calls and the Subcommittees are keeping the topic at the forefront of the work agendas. The lead asked that members consider all the potential sources of topics, including public comments and internal work projects. The hope is that by the next MS call, the Subcommittees will have submitted draft versions of their research priorities.
 - Prevention Strategies Proposal. The lead asked for input about this work item and the group discussed the possible outcomes. Initially the group was going to submit one document but chose to put forth two separate documents: a discussion document on seed purity thresholds and a proposal on best management practices. Two members noted that the NOSB received suggestions in public comment that will be incorporated into the next iteration of the document. The lead will prepare the draft document for review prior to the next call.

- Organic Bug or Organic Hug.
 - The MS Chair highlighted an article for which he was interviewed and noted that he emphasized organics.
 - The Chair also noted that recently he was part of a conversation about designating a new land grant college, and will travel to DC to support the need for organic research via the land grant institutions.
 - A member let the group know about an event taking place this week on her farm in FL. Her farm is the only certified organic farm in her county and is hosting an organic farm sale day, which was funded via a grant. They will have several guests including a soil/microbial analyst from VA, staff from NRCS, who will also discuss soil health, as well as their organic certifier.
- Fall 2015 Milestones Update. See table below.
- Next Meeting Dates. See table below.
- Adjourn

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule: May 12, 2015 1:00 ET June 9, 2015 1:00 ET July 14, 2015 1:00 ET Discuss Research Priorities August 11, 2015 1:00 ET September 8, 2015 1:00 ET November 10, 2015 1:00 ET December 8, 2015 1:00 ET

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, July 14, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke (FT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Harold Austin (HA)

Absent: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair, Nick Maravell (NM); Betsy Rakola (BR); Jennifer Taylor (JT) Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposals	JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS		Fall 2015
May 2012 Framework Proposal		CW - LS		
		ZS - CS		
		ZS - HS		
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Proposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Spr 2016
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Proposal		Fall 2015

Work agenda

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

- Roll call
- Approve June 9, 2015 notes

- Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update ()
- Material TR update (LB)
- Fall Work Plan Items
 - Research Priorities Proposal
 - Prevention Strategies Proposal
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Fall 2015 Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion

- Notes of June 9, 2015 approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update.** BR is currently attending a National Extension conference in South Dakota and will be talking about Organic Agriculture.
- Material TR update (LB). The NOP has received most of the Sunset 2018 TR requests. The Crops Subcommittee will submit its requests for 2018 sunsets along with any TR requests for petitions, which the Subcommittee is currently reviewing. All TR requests are likely to be contracted.
- Fall Work Plan Items
 - Research Priorities Proposal Members discussed the research priorities, which will be incorporated into the proposal for the fall 2015 meeting. According to the Organic Working Group, some of the past priorities were not specific enough to be good candidates for research, so the MS Vice Chair asked that the MS and NOSB revisit some of the prior priorities and perhaps update and resubmit them. The MS will also submit new priorities, such as seed purity. The NOP noted that it is very helpful to the research community if the priorities are focused and specific. It is also useful if the Board limits the total number of priorities instead of submitting a long list. ZS will circulate the last research priorities document, assess the past and current lists, and fuse the two. The Vice Chair asked that members do the same within the other Subcommittees.
 - Prevention Strategies Proposal The MS is ready to move forward with the proposal with the exception of the Seed Purity portion, which is on hold until spring. The Seed Purity portion was originally separated from the main document and circulated to the members for review. The group discussed this separate piece, and decided that it will be put forth as either a discussion document or proposal for the spring 2016 meeting. The MS will review the final version of Prevention Strategies proposal on next call. A member asked about the inclusion of public comments in the document.
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug CW is currently in DC attending an event celebrating the anniversary of the land grant institutions.
- Fall 2015 Milestones Update. See table below.
- Next Meeting Dates. See table below.
- Adjourn

Previous MS Notes Future Call Schedule: June 9, 2015 1:00 ET July 14, 2015 1:00 ET Discuss Research Priorities August 11, 2015 1:00 ET Vote on RP Proposal Vote on Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling September 8, 2015 1:00 ET October 13, 2015 1:00 ET November 10, 2015 1:00 ET December 8, 2015 1:00 ET

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Sep 22 & 29, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, August 11, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke (FT); Jennifer Taylor (JT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Harold Austin (HA); Jean Richardson (JR) - sitting in Absent: Nick Maravell (NM) Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Work agenda				
Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal May 2012 Framework Proposal	JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS	08 11 15	Fall 2015
		CW - LS		
		ZS - CS		
		ZS - HS		
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Proposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Spr 2016
Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling	FT/ZS	Proposal	08 11 15	Fall 2015

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

- Roll call
- Approve July 14, 2015 notes

- Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update (BR)
- Material TR update (LB)
- Fall Work Plan Items
 - Research Priorities Proposal
 - o Prevention Strategies Proposal
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Fall 2015 Milestones Update
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion

- Notes of July 14, 2015 approved with no changes.
- Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update (BR). The OWG met with research leaders at USDA and worked on ways to include language about organic agriculture into various requests for grant proposals. The Organic Policy advisor noted that the Foundation for Food and Agriculture is a great resource with which to share the NOSB Research Priorities. The Foundation was established in the last farm bill, and includes specific requirements for grants, such as a public-private partnership, and matching funds. The MS Chair noted that NIFA has been very helpful with various grants and sponsorship for land grant institutions.
- Material TR update (LB).
 - The new materials report was sent to the NOSB last week. LB noted that not all of the hyperlinks for TRs and petitions are working, as the website was still being populated. The September report will contain updated links.
 - Sunset 2018 materials. The NOP has moved forward with all the TR requests for 2018 sunset materials, with the exception of the one for EPA list 3 inerts. The NOP is seeking additional information before moving forward. The NOP expects the TRs should be completed by the end of December or beginning of January 2016.

• Fall Work Plan Items

 Research Priorities Proposal. The MS members discussed the format of the document and what would be most useful for the research community. Members suggested various additions and edits such as: The inclusion of the criteria used to choose research topics and the prioritization of those topics, so it is clear to the reader; an explanation of projects that may have already been funded, and why they are a continuing priority; and modification of the headings so it is clearer and more specific for researchers. The NOP commented that the document may be a bit too long and contain more information than necessary for the external community. The MS feels that the information is helpful for the NOP and NOSB, and there are few additions to the 2015 list of priorities. After the fall 2015 NOSB meeting, the MS will summarize the priorities for transmission to the USDA funding agencies. The lead will modify the document as discussed and recirculate it to the members in a week so they can review it before the submission deadline.

Motion to accept the 2015 Research Priorities Proposal Motion by: JT Seconded by: HA

Additional Discussion: A member asked that the revised document be recirculated as soon as possible so they have time to review it once more before it is submitted to the

NOP. The Organic Policy Advisor suggested that some of the language could be better aligned with the language in the farm bill, which stipulated what types of research could be funded.

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

• **Prevention Strategies Proposal.** The group discussed the draft proposal and noted some language that was discussed on the last call that did not get incorporated. The group discussed the purpose of this document, which is to recommend that the NOP issue guidance on Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling. A member suggested they add some language indicating that this document was the result of a request by the NOP. The lead will complete the edits and recirculate the document so the MS can review it once more before submission.

Motion to accept the Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling Proposal Motion by: FT Seconded by: ZS Additional Discussion: none Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- Organic Bug or Organic Hug. Members discussed various outreach projects and events they are involved in to bring attention to organic agriculture. Some of these events include: participating in a meeting and conversation about establishing a new land grant institution, which is an initiative that Secretary Vilsack has a strong commitment to; Convincing his University Food Service to add organic products from the university farm to their menu; Hosting farm visits to showcase organic agriculture; Participating in the Southern Regional Food Systems meeting to represent the organic community; and hosting a workshop on organic bee keeping.
- Fall 2015 Milestones Update. See table below. The NOP noted the submission date for proposals, which is August 26.
- Next Meeting Dates. See table below
- Adjourn

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule: July 14, 2015 1:00 ET Discuss Research Priorities August 11, 2015 1:00 ET September 8, 2015 1:00 ET October 13, 2015 1:00 ET November 10, 2015 1:00 ET Summarize and condense the RP for distribution to the community (ALL) December 8, 2015 1:00 ET

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 5, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 8, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, October 14, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Calvin Walker (CW), Chair; Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Francis Thicke (FT); Jennifer Taylor (JT); Colehour Bondera (CBo); Harold Austin (HA) Absent: Nick Maravell (NM) Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB); Betsy Rakola (BR)

Contact			
Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
JT & HA	Subcommittee reps to MS	08 11 15	Fall 2015
	ZS - HS		
ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
70	Decreased On hold Dect of Coord	N1.0	Sec. 2016
25		NA	Spr 2016
	, , ,		
	•		
	Handling" doc		
ZS	Proposal		Spr 2016
FT/ZS	Proposal	08 11 15	Fall 2015
	ZS/LB Contact ZS ZS	CW - LS ZS - CS ZS - HSZS/LBOngoingContactNotesZSProposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" docZSProposal	CW - LS ZS - CS ZS - HSCW - LS ZS - CS ZS - HSZS/LBOngoingNAContactNotesVoteZSProposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" docNAZSProposalProposal

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

- Roll call
- Approve August 11, 2015 notes

- Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update (BR)
- Material TR update (LB)

0

- Fall Meeting Proposals
 - Research Priorities Proposal (Public Comment)
 - Prevention Strategies Proposal (Public Comment)
- Organic Bug or Organic Hug
- Fall 2015 Milestones
- Next Meeting Dates
- Adjourn

Discussion

- Notes of August 11, 2015 were approved with no changes.
- **Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update (BR)** The USDA announced the NIFA Organic Agriculture Research and Extension Initiative (OREI) and Organic Transitions grants. BR will forward the press release to the NOSB with the list of what was funded.
- Material TR update (LB)
 - The October materials report was sent to the NOSB on October 4 and the Nov report will be sent after the fall meeting. The next group of TRs is expected in Dec or Jan
 - LS recently sent a petition to the HS for soy wax in use in mushroom production as an alternative to cheesewax.
- Fall Meeting Proposals
 - Research Priorities Proposal (Public Comment) The lead summarized the comments which she noted were very useful and welcome. JT will present the document at the meeting.
 - Prevention Strategies Proposal (Public Comment) Overall commenters were supportive of the proposal. Some comments suggested that the doc may need more work indicating that some items were not adequately addressed.
- NIFA presentation for fall meeting. MS compiled questions for Dr. Ramaswamy who will be speaking at the fall meeting. The group reviewed the questions and noted that Board members will be able to ask additional questions. BR noted that NOP has been coordinating with NIFA about how to highlight organic agriculture in the NIFA requests for grants. Members discussed other funding avenues such as Agriculture and Food Research Initiative (AFRI), and specialty crop research initiatives and integrative pest management. A member noted that AFRI is a foundational program, focused on basic science and is not necessarily specific to organic so it may not be ideal.
- **Organic Bug or Organic Hug** The materials chair is receiving an award from NIFA and was invited to attend the awards ceremony at NIFA in DC next week.
- Fall 2015 Milestones Reviewed list of milestones below.
- Next Meeting Dates November 10
- The meeting was adjourned

Previous MS Notes Future Call Schedule: September 8, 2015 1:00 ET -cancelled

October 14, 2015 1:00 ET November 10, 2015 1:00 ET Summarize and condense the RP for distribution to the community (ALL) December 8, 2015 1:00 ET

Fall 2015 Milestones	Target date
NOP - Complete Fall 2015 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	July 8, 2015
Request for TRs for 2018 sunset materials	July 15, 2015
NOSB - Fall 2015 proposals due to NOP	Aug 26, 2015
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Sep 8, 2015
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Sep 11, 2015
Public comment webinars	Oct 13 & 20, 2015
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2015
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Oct 9, 2015
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 13, 2015
Fall 2015 NOSB meeting - Stowe, VT	Oct 26 - 29, 2015

National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes Tuesday, December 8, 2015 1:00 pm ET

Attending: Lisa de Lima (LD), Chair; Tom Chapman (TC); Calvin Walker (CW) Absent: Zea Sonnabend, Vice Chair (ZS); Tracy Favre (TF); Betsy Rakola (BR) Jennifer Taylor (JT), Colehour Bondera (CBo); Francis Thicke (FT) Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

Work agenda				
Materials Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Research Priorities Proposal Fall 2016 <u>May 2012 Framework Proposal</u>		Subcommittee reps to MS TF - LS ZS - CS ZS - HS		Fall 2016
Petition and TR tracking	ZS/LB	Ongoing	NA	NA
GMO Projects	Contact	Notes	Vote	Meeting
Seed Purity from GMOs	ZS	Proposal. On hold. Part of Seed Purity doc will be incorporated into "Prevention Strategies for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling" doc	NA	Spr 2016
Excluded Methods Terminology	ZS	Proposal		Spr 2016

Other Projects

Project Idea	Contact	Notes*	Vote	Meeting

- Approve October 14, 2015 notes
- Update from Calvin on reformatting of research proposals
- Discuss expert panel suggestion excluded methods
- Discuss addition of two calls
- Adjourn

Discussion

- Notes of October 14, 2015 were approved with no changes
- **Organic and Sustainable Working Group Update.** The former MS chair reminded the group that they will have an update from the Organic Policy Advisor about her communication with the director of NIFA regarding the Agriculture and Food Research Initiative (AFRI) grants. He also noted that Dr. Ramaswamy already provided an update about the capacity building grants.
- **Reformatting of Research Priorities recommendation.** CW will contact the lead writer and complete the coversheet and summary by this Friday.
- Materials update (LB). The NOP sent an updated materials report to the NOSB last week, and noted that the aquaculture materials should have been listed with a review date of TBD, and will be updated for the January report. The NOP is anticipating sending one new petition and one TR soon. There are a number of TRs currently in development, or being revised.
- Expert panel on Excluded Methods Terminology and Seed Purity. The Crops Chair recently circulated some ideas for an expert panel for the April 2016 meeting. The MS chair asked for feedback about presenting this request to the Executive Committee on December 11. Member were supportive of this idea and will discuss the details at a later date, pending approval.
- The Chair noted the addition of two calls: January 26 and February 23.
- The NOP indicated that the new Subcommittee Chairs should identify Vice Chairs.
- The NOP adjusted the table above to indicate the representatives who will act as liaisons between each of the Subcommittee and the MS for the Research Priorities.
- The meeting was adjourned

Previous MS Notes

Future Call Schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 ET) October 14, 2015 November 10, 2015 - cancelled December 8, 2015 January 12, 2016 January 26, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday) February 9, 2016 February 23, 2016 (Additional call - 4th Tuesday) March 8, 2016 April 12, 2016 May 10, 2016 June 14, 2016 July 12 2016 August 9, 2016 September 13, 2016 October 11, 2016 November 8, 2016 December 13, 2016

Spring 2016 Milestones

New NOSB member orientation	?
NOP - Complete Spring 2016 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 10, 2016
NOSB - Spring 2016 proposals due to NOP	Feb 26, 2016
NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment	Mar 8, 2016
Discuss work agendas on ES call	Mar 11, 2016
Public comment webinars	??
Public comment closes	Apr 6, 2016
Work agendas finalized on ES call (last call before fall meeting)	Apr 8, 2016
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 11, 2016
Spring 2016 NOSB meeting – Washington, DC	Apr 25 - 27, 2016