

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, January 8, 2013, 1:00 pm EST**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Joe Dickson (JD), Calvin Walker (CW), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Mac Stone (MS) - sitting in

**Absent:** Lisa Brines (LB), Wendy Fulwider (WF),

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Emily Brown Rosen (EBR) –substituting for LBrines

**Work Plan**

| Project  | Reviewer                          | Status  | Vote | Target Meeting      |
|--|-----------------------------------|---|------|---------------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process                                      | JFe (for Materials), MS (for PDS) | Proposal. Jointly w/PDS (Materials will lead and pass along the document to PDS). |      | Spr 2013            |
| Confidential Business Information (CBI) Transparency   | ZS, JFe, and CW                   | Discussion doc, jointly w/PDS (JFe) in Spring? Prop in fall?                      |      | Spr 2013/Fall 2013? |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe                               | Discussion document   |      | Spr 2013            |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>                       | ZS & CW & JFe                     |   |      | Fall 2013           |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB                             | Ongoing   | N/A  | N/A                 |
| Material initiation policy – NOP has proposed that this be renamed (Substance Annotation/Clean-up) | JFe/JT                            | Joint w/PDS (PDS will lead)   |      | TBD                 |
| How to address scientific uncertainty  | JFe                               | Will begin this after “Update Petition Process and CBI projects” are complete     |      | TBD                 |

**Agenda:**

- Approve notes from December 19
- Continue discussion of “Definition of production aids”
- Discuss “Examine and update petition and technical review process” workplan item (JFe/MS)
- Continued discussion of CBI policy (ZS, JFe, and CW)
- Review letter addressing research priorities

## **Discussion:**

- Notes from the December 19 call were approved with no changes.
- Examine and update petition and technical review process – The group discussed the value of producing a discussion document versus a proposal. Since this is a process document, the group decided that it makes sense to put forth a proposal. JFe will restructure the document and include references to the PPM (i.e. procedure for handling technical reviews). The Materials Subcommittee will review the updated document on next call.
- Production aids: Members discussed and edited the draft document, and JFe asked for feedback and assistance with two items in the discussion section. The group decided that it would best be put forth as a discussion document and not a proposal. The chair asked for input from the NOP regarding petitioned items that do not fall into an OFPA category (toxins from bacteria, pheromones, soaps, oils, etc .... and “production aids”) NOP explained that “production aids” has been interpreted fairly broadly in the past by NOSB, and that there are a number of items on the List that do not fit exactly into the other OFPA categories, which only include crop and livestock materials. LB and EBR will look for examples to include in the document which may help clarify the discussion. The group then discussed the value of proceeding with this document. A member asked what precipitated this document, to which another member responded that the board is asked to evaluate petitions using this criterion and there has been lack of clarity on the issue. The group agreed that there is value in asking for feedback about this issue, while acknowledging that this may not lead to a proposal. The group will look at this again during the next meeting.
- Letter addressing research priorities: The Subcommittee discussed the draft letters, and CW discussed the various components and documents that he used to compile the background information, and to decide to whom to address the letters. One of the components was a list of discipline codes, which the group feels will provide more specificity to make it easier for institutions to take action. CW will make some edits, including updating the research priorities to reflect the current list, combining some items, and updating the date of the letter, and the group will discuss it further on the next call.
- CBI: Will defer this to the next call (January 22)
- Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether (PGME) is being petitioned as a boiler water additive (processing aid) to be used for livestock feed pellets only on 205.605. The NOP is sending this to the Materials Subcommittee to decide which Subcommittee should review it. The NOP would suggest sending this petition to the Handling Subcommittee, since the petitioned use is as a processing aid and the petitioner has requested addition to 205.605. The group will discuss this on the next call.

## **Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

December 19, 2012 1:00 pm EST

- Continue discussion of “Examine and update petition and technical review process” (JFe/MS)
- Discuss “Definition of production aids”

January 8, 2013 1:00 pm EST

- Examine and update petition and technical review process (JFe/MS)
- Continued discussion of CBI policy (ZS, JFe, and CW)

- Continue discussion of “Definition of production aids”
- Review letter addressing research priorities

January 22, 2013 1:00 pm EST

Review the “Examine and update petition and technical review process” document  
 Continue discussion of production aids  
 Review revised letter addressing research priorities  
 Discuss Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether (PGME)

February 12, 2013 1:00 pm EST - proposals due

February 26, 2013 1:00 pm EST

March 12, 2013 1:00 pm EST

March 26, 2013 1:00 pm EST

| Spring 2013 Milestones                                 | Target date       |
|--|-------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | February 8, 2013  |
| Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP                       | February 12, 2013 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | February 19, 2013 |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | March 1, 2013     |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | March 8, 2013     |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | March 11, 2013    |
| Public comment closes                                  | March 19, 2013    |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | March 25, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | March 29, 2013    |
| Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR                | April 8-11, 2013  |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, January 22, 2013, 1:00 pm EST**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Calvin Walker (CW), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Joe Dickson (JD), Mac Stone (MS) - sitting in

**Absent:** Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project   | Reviewer                          | Status   | Vote     | Target Meeting      |
|---|-----------------------------------|--|----------|---------------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process. Includes Threshold (two-stage) TRs, and Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy | JFe (for Materials), MS (for PDS) | Proposal? Jointly w/PDS (Materials will lead and pass along the document to PDS).<br><br>Discussion doc: Threshold (two-stage) TRs-spring 2013 portion |          | Spr 2013            |
| Confidential Business Information (CBI) Transparency  | ZS, JFe, and CW                   | Discussion doc, jointly w/PDS (JFe) in Spring? Prop in fall?   | 01 22 13 | Spr 2013/Fall 2013? |
| Definition of production aids   | JFe                               | Discussion document  |          | Spr 2013            |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>  | ZS & CW & JFe                     |  |          | Fall 2013           |
| Petition and TR tracking  | ZS/LB                             | Ongoing  | N/A      | N/A                 |
| Material initiation policy – NOP has proposed that this be renamed (Substance Annotation/Clean-up)  | JFe/JT                            | Joint w/PDS (PDS will lead)  |          | Spr 2013            |
| How to address scientific uncertainty   | JFe                               | Will begin this after “Update Petition Process and CBI projects” are complete  |          | TBD                 |
| Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether (PGME)  | NA                                | Determine which Subcommittee will review   | NA       | TBD                 |

**Agenda:**

- Approve notes from January 8 call
- Discuss the CBI document
- Review the “Examine and update petition and technical review process” document
- Continue discussion of production aids
- Review revised letter addressing research priorities
- Discuss Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether (PGME)

**Discussion:**

- Notes from the January 8 call approved with no changes.
- CBI – The group discussed and made edits to the most recent draft document on CBI, particularly the recommendations section. They also discussed at length the language around the affidavit section and the group decided to include it and determine how to proceed after public comment is received. NOP indicated concerns with the affidavit requirement. One member noted that he is opposed to the inclusion of this language. ZS will complete the edits to the document and send it to the chair of the PDS. The group agreed that they were ready to vote.

**Vote on CBI**

Motion to adopt the proposal on Confidential Business Information (CBI) from the MS subcommittee

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: CW

Yes: 6 No: 0 Absent:1 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

- Examine and update petition and technical review process: JFe will make a minor edits and resend it to the group prior to the Feb 12<sup>th</sup> meeting at which time they will vote.
- Production aids: The group discussed the most recent edits to the draft document which were circulated via email on January 16, 2013.
- Letter to funders: will discuss on next call.
- PGME: Petitioned for use as boiler water additive to be used for livestock feed pellets only. The petitioner has requested addition of PGME to section 205.605, which means the petition would get sent to the Handling Subcommittee for review, who could then determine whether they need feedback from the Livestock Subcommittee or not The NOP requested feedback from the Materials Subcommittee regarding the appropriate Subcommittee for review, and the MS indicated its preference to send it to the Handling Subcommittee.

**Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

January 22, 2013 1:00 pm EST

Review the “Examine and update petition and technical review process” document  
 Continue discussion of production aids  
 Review revised letter addressing research priorities  
 Discuss Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether (PGME)  
 CBI

February 12, 2013 1:00 pm EST - proposals due

Vote on “Examine and update petition and technical review process”  
 Continue Discussion/vote on production aids  
 Discuss letter to funders  
 Discuss Policy Subcommittee co-docs

February 26, 2013 1:00 pm EST

March 12, 2013 1:00 pm EST

March 26, 2013 1:00 pm EST

| Spring 2013 Milestones                                 | Target date       |
|--|-------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | February 8, 2013  |
| Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP                       | February 12, 2013 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | February 19, 2013 |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | March 1, 2013     |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | March 8, 2013     |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | March 11, 2013    |
| Public comment closes                                  | March 19, 2013    |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | March 25, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | March 29, 2013    |
| Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR                | April 8-11, 2013  |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, February 12, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Calvin Walker (CW), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Mac Stone (MS) - sitting in

**Absent:** Wendy Fulwider (WF), Joe Dickson (JD)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project  | Reviewer                          | Status   | Vote  | Target Meeting |
|--|-----------------------------------|--|---|----------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process. Includes Process for limited scope TR's, and Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy | JFe (for Materials), MS (for PDS) | Jointly w/PDS (Materials will lead.<br><br>Discussion doc: Process for limited scope TR's -spring 2013 portion | 02 12 13                                    | Spr 2013       |
| Confidential Business Information (CBI) Transparency   | ZS, JFe, and CW                   | Discussion document: Jointly w/PDS (JFe)   | 01 22 13 withdrawn.<br>Voted on DD 02 12 13 | Spr 2013       |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe                               | Discussion document  | 02 12 13                                    | Spr 2013       |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>   | ZS & CW & JFe                     |  |   | Fall 2013      |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB                             | Ongoing  | N/A   | N/A            |
| Material initiation policy – NOP has proposed that this be renamed (Substance Annotation/Clean-up)   | JFe/JT                            | Joint w/PDS ( <b>PDS will lead</b> )   | PDS voted 02 13 13                          | Spr 2013       |
| How to address scientific uncertainty  | JFe                               | Will begin this after "Update Petition Process and CBI projects" are complete                                  |   | TBD            |
| Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether (PGME)   | NA                                | Sent to Handling 01 28 13  | NA  | TBD            |

## **Agenda:**

- Approve notes from January 22 call
- Review and vote on the "Examine and update petition ...." ("Two Stage...") proposal
- Review and vote on Production Aids discussion document
- Discuss the CBI document
- Discuss Policy Subcommittee co-doc on Material Initiation
- Workplan (see notes for current workplan)

## **Discussion:**

- Notes from the January 22 call approved with no changes
- "Two Stage process on technical reviews" proposal. The group clarified the placement of this document with the Materials Subcommittee and not the PDS and decided to rename the document "Process for limited scope TR's", which is more descriptive and accurate. The NOP noted that the abbreviated TR process would not be a default process, and noted the flexibility the NOSB already has used to request limited scope TRs. The members discussed various components in the proposal such as the use of the phrase eligibility, and how the petition process currently works. They also discussed the process by which a material gets from the Subcommittee to the full Board for vote, and how that determination is made. JFe will make some minor edits and resend the final version to group and the Program.

### **Vote on Process for limited scope TR's**

Motion to adopt Process for Limited Scope TRs Discussion Document

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: JFe

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Absent: 2 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

- Production Aids discussion document. There was no further discussion and the members proceeded to a vote

### **Vote on Production Aids discussion document**

Motion to adopt Production Aids to move forward to the full NOSB

Motion by: JFe

Seconded by: JT

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Absent: 2 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

- CBI proposal. A motion was made to accept the CBI proposal and ZS, referencing the recent note from the NOP, noted that she is uncomfortable proceeding with the CBI document as is when the Subcommittee is now aware that they may have the option of not accepting CBI at all. The group discussed issuing this as a discussion document rather than a proposal so they can solicit feedback from the public, and came to the consensus that it would be put forth as such. (MA noted the change in the table above). The program is supportive of eliminating the collection of CBI as an option and the members discussed this further. A member proposed a question to include in the discussion document for the public commenters: would they (the public) be comfortable with the NOSB reviewing CBI?



**Vote on CBI discussion document:**

Motion to withdraw original motion on CBI was unanimous, and a new motion was proposed.

Motion to adopt the discussion document on Confidential Business Information (CBI) in petitions

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: CW

Additional discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 0 Absent: 2 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0

ZS will send the edited document Thursday, and asked that the members provide feedback by no later than Friday, February 15.

- Policy Subcommittee co-doc on Material Initiation (DD) –The group discussed various aspects of this item including potential unintended consequences, such as creating a path through which an unmanageable number of requests are submitted that prioritizations demands and processes become cumbersome and make it hard to focus on the really key priorities.

**Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

January 22, 2013 1:00 pm EST

Review the “Examine and update petition and technical review process” document  
Continue discussion of production aids  
Review revised letter addressing research priorities  
Discuss Polyalkylene glycol monobutyl ether (PGME)  
CBI

February 12, 2013 1:00 pm EST - proposals due

Vote on “Examine and update petition and technical review process”  
Continue Discussion/vote on production aids  
Discuss letter to funders  
Discuss Policy Subcommittee co-docs

February 26, 2013 1:00 pm EST

March 12, 2013 1:00 pm EST

March 26, 2013 1:00 pm EST

| Spring 2013 Milestones                                 | Target date       |
|--|-------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | February 8, 2013  |
| Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP                       | February 12, 2013 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | February 19, 2013 |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | March 1, 2013     |

|  |                  |
|--|------------------|
| Discuss workplans on ES call                       | March 8, 2013    |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB | March 11, 2013   |
| Public comment closes                              | March 19, 2013   |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB        | March 25, 2013   |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                     | March 29, 2013   |
| Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR            | April 8-11, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, February 26, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Calvin Walker (CW), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Joe Dickson (JD), Mac Stone (MS) - observing

**Absent:** Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project  | Reviewer                          | Status   | Vote  | Target Meeting |
|--|-----------------------------------|--|---|----------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process. Includes Process for limited scope TR's, and Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy | JFe (for Materials), MS (for PDS) | Jointly w/PDS (Materials will lead.<br><br>Discussion doc: Process for limited scope TR's -spring 2013 portion | 02 12 13                                    | Spr 2013       |
| Confidential Business Information (CBI) Transparency   | ZS, JFe, and CW                   | Discussion document: Jointly w/PDS (JFe)   | 01 22 13 withdrawn.<br>Voted on DD 02 12 13 | Spr 2013       |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe                               | Discussion document  | 02 12 13                                    | Spr 2013       |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>   | ZS & CW & JFe                     |  |   | Fall 2013      |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB                             | Ongoing  | N/A   | N/A            |
| Material initiation policy – NOP has proposed that this be renamed (Substance Annotation/Clean-up)   | JFe/JT                            | Joint w/PDS ( <b>PDS will lead</b> )   | PDS voted 02 13 13                          | Spr 2013       |

**Agenda:**

- Approve notes from February 12, 2013 call
- Discuss workplan
- Research priorities letters

**Discussion:**

- Notes from the February 12, 2013 call approved with no changes.
- The group discussed the Research Priorities letters, which will be sent by NOP to two researchers/institutions; USDA's Agricultural Research Services (ARS) and National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA). A member suggested sending a similar letter to 1994 land grant institutions as well. CW will locate a contact person and forward the letter and contact name to the Deputy Administrator for consideration. Each of these agencies has a public comment period and CW encouraged members to submit comments about the need for organic research. The Chair will send the letters to the Deputy Administrator with the recommendation that the additional recipient from 1994 land grant institutions be added.
- Workplan – Research Priorities will be included on the fall 2013 workplan. The chair asked for volunteers to lead this effort and would like to identify someone before the fall workplans are finalized.
- Members discussed the process by which joint Subcommittees review documents, which at this point is not well defined. MS indicated that the Executive Subcommittee will need to discuss this further to determine how best to organize this process. Until the joint review process is in place, the workplan item entitled Examine and Update Petition and Technical Review (TR) process will be under the purview of the Materials Subcommittee and not be a joint project with PDS.

**Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

February 12, 2013 1:00 pm ET - proposals due

Vote on "Examine and update petition and technical review process"

Continue Discussion/vote on production aids

Discuss letter to funders

Discuss Policy Subcommittee co-docs

February 26, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Workplans

March 12, 2013 1:00 pm ET

March 26, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Spring 2013 Milestones                                 | Target date       |
|--|-------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | February 8, 2013  |
| Spring 2013 proposals due to NOP                       | February 12, 2013 |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | February 19, 2013 |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | March 1, 2013     |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | March 8, 2013     |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | March 11, 2013    |
| Public comment closes                                  | March 19, 2013    |

|   |                  |
|---|------------------|
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB | March 25, 2013   |
| Workplans finalized on ES call              | March 29, 2013   |
| Spring 2013 NOSB Meeting – Portland, OR     | April 8-11, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, April 23, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Tracy Favre (TF), Calvin Walker (CW), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Joe Dickson (JD), Jay Feldman (JFe), Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Absent:** Lisa Brines (LB)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Stacy Jones King (SJK)-substituting for LB

**Work Plan**

| Project   | Contact | Status  | Vote | Meeting             |
|---|---------|---|------|---------------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process. (Includes Process for limited scope TR's, Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy, CBI) |         | Materials will lead<br><br>CBI- TF<br>Lmtd Scope TR-JFe<br>Convening of technical advisory boards- JFe<br>Misc from LB about updating petition and TR process- ZS |      | Proposal Fall 2013  |
| Definition of production aids   | JFe     | Will bring proposal to group on next call   |      | Proposal Fall 2013  |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>  | JT      | Subcommittee reps to GMO ad hoc<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS   |      | Proposals Fall 2013 |
| Petition and TR tracking  | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA   | N/A                 |
| How to address scientific uncertainty   | JFe     | Will begin this after "Update Petition Process and CBI projects" are complete   |      | TBD                 |
| Classification of Materials Guidance  | ZS, JFe |   |      | ?                   |

**Agenda:**

- Approve notes from February 26, 2013 call
- Workplan review and assignments
- Discussion of the Classification of Materials Guidance and Materials List from NOP and whether we as a subcommittee should comment on it.

**Discussion:**

- Notes from the February 26, 2013 call approved with no changes
- Workplan review and assignments
  - Production aids - JFe will bring a proposal to the next meeting for discussion by the group
  - Research Priorities Proposals. Each one of the Subcommittee reps should continue to remind their respective Subcommittees to turn in research priorities and work with JT to establish a date for submission so the MS has time to narrow list.
  - A member asked about deadlines for requesting TRs for items that will be voted on at the fall 2013 meeting. SJK will ask LB to inform the group about said dates.
- Research Priorities letter approved at the last Board meeting is currently being reviewed by Mark Lipson. MA will extend an Invitation to Mark to sit in on the next call to update the group about the letter's status.
- Classification of materials draft guidance – The current Federal Register notice seeks comments on a number of items that are dispersed between Subcommittees, with a due date of June 3. The group discussed whether or not the MS should respond to this and whether or not it needs to be added to the workplan. The Chair will discuss this further with the Executive Subcommittee. JFe and ZS will talk offline about how to proceed and prepare a document for the May 28 call.

**Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

April 23, 2013 1:00 pm ET

May 14, 2013 1:00 pm ET- Cancelled (won't have any documents ready for discussion)

May 28, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Mark Lipson- update on Research Priorities letter

Classification of materials draft guidance

June 11, 2013 1:00 pm ET

CBI- TF

Lmtd Scope TR-JFe

Convening of technical advisory boards- JFe

June 25, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Draft Misc from LB about updating petition and TR process- ZS

Definition of production aids

July 9, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Research Priorities Proposals

July 23, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 13, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones            | Target date     |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda | August 9, 2013  |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP  | August 27, 2013 |

|  |                     |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        |                     |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           |                     |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     |                     |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 21-24, 2013 |



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, May 28, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Joe Dickson (JD), Jay Feldman (JFe), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Calvin Walker (CW), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Mac Stone-sitting in

**Absent:** Tracy Favre (TF)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML)

**Work Plan**

| Project   | Contact | Status  | Vote | Meeting            |
|---|---------|---|------|--------------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process. (Includes Process for limited scope TR's, Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy, CBI) |         | Materials will lead<br><br>CBI- TF<br>Lmtd Scope TR-JFe<br>Convening of technical advisory boards- JFe<br>Misc from LB about updating petition and TR process- ZS |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Definition of production aids   | JFe     |   |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>  | JT      | Subcommittee reps to GMO ad hoc<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS   |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Petition and TR tracking  | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA   | N/A                |
| How to address scientific uncertainty   | JFe     | Will begin this after "Update Petition Process and CBI projects" are complete   |      | TBD                |
| Classification of Materials Guidance  | ZS, JFe |   |      | ?                  |

**Agenda:**

- Approve notes from April 23, 2013 call
- Research Priorities letter(s) from Mark Lipson
- Classification of Materials and Materials in Organic Crop Production – Draft Guidance.

## Discussion:

- Notes from the April 23, 2013 call approved with no changes.
- Research Priorities letter(s) (ML). The letter will be addressed to the Undersecretary and copied to USDA administrators. The letter contains a request for ongoing follow up on specific items in four categories: 1) Organic practices/methods, including National List materials, non-synthetic alternatives to fire blight, Sodium Carbonate, ID of non-GMO vaccines, alternatives for synthetic methionine, production of carrageenan, etc; 2) Organic systems - Broader longer range topics such as impacts of biodiversity, impact on open/closed aquaculture systems; 3) Health and safety impacts such as evaluation of carrageenan breakdown; and 4) Program eligibility and management, such as capacity building grants like the National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA). A member asked about the incorporation of a clause asking that the Deputy Administrator meet with representatives to discuss these issues, which is included in the section about follow up. ML expects the letter will be sent next week. ML also gave the group an update about the status of the farm bill: Both Senate and House versions have mandatory funding for the Organic Agriculture Research and Extension Initiative (OREI). The House bill has \$20M in markup. A member asked about the restoration of funding for the Cost Share program which was only included in the Senate Version.
- Classification of Materials and Materials in Organic Crop Production - Draft Guidance (JFe). Members discussed various comments that they are working on, both inside and outside the NOSB, for submission to the NOP open comment period. JFe summarized key points from Beyond Pesticide's (BP) comments, which will be posted to the docket as a public comment. Key issues include: Review of synthetic vs. non-synthetic substances; clarification of the definition of chemical change; definition of "natural"; no definition for the terms "Technical Effects" and "Functional Effects.". The group felt that the decision tree is good, but there is a need to define some additional terms. There was also a concern about having to reclassify items based on the new policy if the NOP adopts it. ZS circulated draft comments from CCOF that overlap some issues with BPs, including definitions, but they also had additional comments. The description of combustion is somewhat clear but could be more so, for example, some biological materials require higher temps for combustion, and that is not delineated; the definition of agricultural/non-agricultural which the Handling Subcommittee will also comment on; and the definition of extraction. Another problem is that the current decision tree model, if adopted as final, may classify microorganisms such as bacteria and algae as agricultural so this needs to be addressed. This also has implications for livestock feed. CCOF also has comments on individual materials. For petitioned materials, such as vinasse, they are asking for a delay until the NOSB can review this material which is currently on the workplan. Members also discussed the definition of the word substance, which the NOP noted isn't defined in the regulations, but is in the classification table in the draft guidance adapted from the NOSB recommendation. The HS will be writing comments about the ag/non ag topic with a focus on microorganisms, and will either submit them separately or combine them with Materials.
- NOP update on the petition process (LB). The NOP will be writing a memo to the NOSB about an update to the petition process, and expects to have it out soon. LB noted that it should be released prior to the next Materials call (June 25) but feels that the memo is consistent with recent NOP feedback to the MS, so the MS can carry on with their review and not wait for the memo.
- The members discussed comments on the proposed rule for Sunset 2013, which is currently open for public comment. In the proposed rule, the NOP proposed the backup motions to relist

without changes. The group consensus is that this limits the NOSB's authority and the Chair urged the members to submit comments regarding this important topic.

#### **Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

May 28, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Mark Lipson- update on Research Priorities letter

Classification of materials draft guidance

June 11, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Classification of Materials and Materials in Organic Crop Production Guidance review comments before submission

CBI (TF)

Lmtd Scope TR (JFe)

Convening of technical advisory boards (JFe)

June 25, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Draft from LB about updating petition and TR process (ZS)

Definition of production aids (JFe)

July 9, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Research Priorities Proposals (all)

July 23, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 13, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date         |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013      |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013     |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        |                     |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           |                     |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     |                     |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 21-24, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, June 11, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Calvin Walker (CW), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Tracy Favre (TF)

**Absent:** Joe Dickson (JD), Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project   | Contact | Status  | Vote | Meeting            |
|---|---------|---|------|--------------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process. (Includes Process for limited scope TR's, Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy, CBI) |         | Materials will lead<br><br>CBI- TF<br>Lmtd Scope TR-JFe<br>Convening of technical advisory boards- JFe<br>Misc from LB about updating petition and TR process- ZS |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Definition of production aids   | JFe     |   |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>  | JT      | Subcommittee reps to GMO ad hoc<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS   |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Petition and TR tracking  | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA   | N/A                |
| How to address scientific uncertainty   | JFe     | Will begin this after "Update Petition Process and CBI projects" are complete   |      | TBD                |
| Classification of Materials Guidance  | ZS, JFe |   |      | ?                  |

**Agenda:**

- Approve notes of May 28
- Classification of Materials comments (ZS)
- CBI (TF)
- Lmtd Scope TR (JFe)

**Discussion:**

- Notes of May 28 approved with no changes
- Classification of Materials (ZS) – The group discussed the Materials Subcommittee comments on the Classification guidance, which included various substances and materials such as combustion, naturally occurring biological processes, technical and functional effects and removal, and proposed policy changes. They also discussed the comment about classifying microorganisms and the ag/non-ag decision tree, noting that the comment needs some editing. ZS will work with the Handling Subcommittee to craft something clearer.
- CBI (TF). Members discussed the various options for accepting or not accepting Confidential Business Information (CBI), for example not allowing CBI for ingredients in materials or the manufacturing process. There were mixed opinions among the Subcommittee members and they acknowledged the need to discuss it further. With regard to the affidavit process, most people felt it was not helpful, although most certifiers were supportive of it because it is something they are familiar with. The group asked that the NOP discuss their position on CBI requirements during the next call on June 25.
- Limited Scope TR (JFe) - the group deferred this discussion to the next call for lack of time.

**Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

June 11, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Classification of Materials and Materials in Organic Crop Production Guidance (review comments before submission)

CBI (TF)

Limited Scope TR (JFe) – postponed to next meeting

Convening of technical advisory boards (JFe) - postponed

June 25, 2013 1:00 pm ET

CBI (LB/TF) –Background from NOP about potential exclusion of CBI.

Limited Scope TR (JFe)

Draft from LB about updating petition and TR process (ZS)

July 9, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Convening of technical advisory boards (JFe)

Definition of production aids (JFe)

Research Priorities Proposals (all)

July 23, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 13, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones            | Target date     |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda | August 9, 2013  |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP  | August 27, 2013 |

|  |                     |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        |                     |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           |                     |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     |                     |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 21-24, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, June 25, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Calvin Walker (CW), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Tracy Favre (TF), Joe Dickson (JD), Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project   | Contact | Status  | Vote | Meeting            |
|---|---------|---|------|--------------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process. (Includes Process for limited scope TR's, Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy, CBI) |         | Materials will lead<br><br>CBI- TF<br><br>Convening of technical advisory panels- JFe<br><br>Misc from LB about updating petition and TR process- ZS<br><br>Lmtd Scope TR-JFe |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Definition of production aids   | JFe     |   |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>  | JT      | Subcommittee reps to GMO ad hoc<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS   |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Petition and TR tracking  | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA   | N/A                |
| How to address scientific uncertainty   | JFe     | Will begin this after "Update Petition Process and CBI projects" are complete   |      | TBD                |
| Classification of Materials Guidance  | ZS, JFe |   |      | ?                  |

### Agenda:

- Approve notes of June 11
- CBI
- Limited Scope TR
- Update from Lisa about additional TRs
- Update petition and TR process (no draft, just concept)
- Convening of technical advisory boards

### **Discussion:**

- Notes of June 11 approved with no changes
- **Confidential Business Information (CBI)** - The group had a brief discussion about the provisions in the petition guidelines that allow for CBI. The NOP's position is that they would prefer to eliminate the provision for CBI primarily for reasons of transparency. CBI is not shared with the NOSB members, and the TR contractor cannot include it in the Technical report, so it is not useful. ZS noted that petitioners could and sometimes do, submit the ingredients, but not the formula or recipe. This sometimes occurs when petitioners submit research papers. Another consideration for the NOP is preventing the opportunity for accidental disclosure of CBI during public discussions. The group reached consensus about moving forward with a proposal to eliminate the inclusion of CBI in the petitions. TF will write a proposal that will include language about including ingredient lists while excluding recipes or formulas.
- **Limited Scope TR**- The lead reviewer indicated that there was not much support for additional work on this item, so they are removing it.
- **NOP TR Update.** The NOP informed the group of funding availability for a few additional TRs before the end of the fiscal year, so the program has put several materials in the queue for TRs that previously only had limited technical information available
- **Update petition and TR process** - LB forwarded ZS a Word version of the current petition guidelines. ZS will look at language in the guidelines and in the PPM and will have a draft ready for the July 9 call.
- **Convening of technical advisory panels.** Members discussed the current language in the PPM from OFPA (page 34 and throughout document) including specific guidelines, and whether or not this section needed to be updated. They felt that past Boards did a good job outlining this in the PPM, but also spoke about other models for convening technical advisory panels, such as OMRIs. The group discussed whether or not the language needed to be changed now that TRs are used instead of TAPs, since the language in the PPM does not align with the current practices. Most members agreed that updating the language to align with current practices was the best path. JFe will discuss this with the PDS to get their opinion and decide from there whether or not they want to change it. The Chair indicated that changes may not be needed and this workplan item will not go to the fall meeting.

### Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:

June 25, 2013 1:00 pm ET

CBI (LB/TF) –Background from NOP about potential exclusion of CBI.

Limited Scope TR (JFe)

Draft from LB about updating petition and TR process (ZS)



July 9, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Convening of technical advisory panels (JFe) - may remove from workplan for now

Definition of production aids (JFe)

Research Priorities Proposals (all)

July 23, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 13, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date         |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013      |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013     |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        |                     |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           |                     |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     |                     |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 21-24, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, July 9, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Calvin Walker (CW), Tracy Favre (TF), Joe Dickson (JD), Mac Stone (CW)

**Absent:** Wendy Fulwider (WF), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project  | Contact | Status  | Vote | Meeting            |
|--|---------|---|------|--------------------|
| Examine and update petition and technical review (TR) process.<br>(Includes Process for limited scope TR's, Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy, CBI) |         | Materials will lead<br><br>CBI (TF)<br><br>Misc from LB about updating petition and TR process ( ZS)<br><br>Convening of technical advisory panels (JFe) - TBD<br>Lmtd Scope TR (JFe) - TBD |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe     |   |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>   | JT      | Subcommittee reps to GMO ad hoc<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS   |      | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA   | N/A                |
| How to address scientific uncertainty  | JFe     | Will begin this after "Update Petition Process and CBI projects" are complete   |      | TBD                |
| Classification of Materials Guidance   | ZS, JFe |   |      | ?                  |

**Agenda:**

- Approve notes from last call, June 25
- Update petition and TR process
- CBI draft proposal (TF)

- Defining Production Aids (JFe)
- Research Priorities (JT)

#### **Discussion:**

- Notes of June 25 approved with no changes except the acknowledgement that the future call schedule (see below) was altered to reflect an updated workplan.
- Update petition and TR process. ZS forwarded a previous email from the NOP about updating the Petition and TR Process, with key points highlighted, as well as a document with proposed revisions and asked the members for questions or comments.
- The group discussed and edited various sections of the petition guidelines including specific language regarding annotations, and was in agreement that the language was appropriate. ZS will make the changes and recirculate the document to the group for further discussion.
- Members discussed the draft document on the Materials Review Procedure which was circulated to the group before the call. The process that is listed in the PPM, whereby the NOP forwards all petitions to the Materials Subcommittee, who then sends it to the appropriate Subcommittee for review, is not the current practice and the group is updating it to reflect the process currently in use. ZS asked that the group continue to think about item # 5 in the section entitled "...basic principles that should be considered when dealing with a third party expert:" The members also discussed the advantages and drawbacks of initiating a technical report before the petition has been reviewed by the NOSB Subcommittee. No decision was made on this issue during the call. Also discussed were alternative mechanisms for approving technical reports, which was requested by the NOP. There was not much support in the Subcommittee to revise the procedures whereby the Subcommittee determines whether a technical report is sufficient for posting.
- In the interest of time, the Chair summarized the items that will be moved to the next call and reminded the group that the research priorities are due soon.
- CW added that he would like to have access to information about who authored a TR. He also noted that in the past he has sometimes had difficulty locating references that are listed in the TRs and asked for assistance from the NOP with that. NOP indicated that the organization that develops the TR is listed in the footer of the report, but authors have not been individually listed.

#### **Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

July 9, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Update petition and TR process  
CBI draft proposal (TF) – postponed due to time  
Definition of production aids (JFe) - postponed due to time  
Research Priorities Proposals (all) - postponed due to time

July 23, 2013 1:00 pm ET

CBI draft proposal (TF)  
Defining Production Aids (JFe)  
Research Priorities (JT)

August 13, 2013 1:00 pm ET

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date         |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013      |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013     |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        |                     |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           |                     |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     |                     |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 21-24, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, July 23, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Joe Dickson (JD), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Calvin Walker (CW)

**Absent:** none

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project   | Contact | Status  | Vote     | Meeting            |
|---|---------|---|----------|--------------------|
| Update petition and TR process – Confidential Business Information (CBI)                            | TF      |   | 07 23 13 | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Update petition and TR process - Misc topics  | ZS/LB   | Misc edits from LB  |          | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Update petition and TR process - (Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy) | JFe     |   |          | TBD                |
| Definition of production aids   | JFe     |   |          | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>                        | JT      | Subcommittee reps to GMO ad hoc<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS               |          | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Petition and TR tracking  | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA       | N/A                |
| How to address scientific uncertainty   | JFe     | Will begin this after “Update Petition Process and CBI projects” are complete |          | TBD                |
| Classification of Materials Guidance  | ZS, JFe |   |          | ?                  |

**Agenda:**

- Review/approve the notes from July 9

- CBI draft proposal (TF)
- Definition of Production Aids (JFe)
- Research Priorities progress report (JT)
- Update the petition and TR process (ZS)

#### **Discussion:**

- Notes of July 9 approved with no changes.
- **Definition of Production Aids (JFe)** - JFe amended the draft document and recirculated it to the group prior to the call. The group discussed various edits that were made, including the added language regarding livestock bedding. The NOP commented about several specific items in the document, such as insect traps which are on the National List and are considered production aids in OFPA, but are not listed under production aids, and the inclusion of the word “synthetic”. A member indicated that she felt it was not appropriate to ask the NOP to revise the rule, and did not support the proposal as written. The NOP noted that adding the definition to the PPM would be less complicated than changing the regulation. Several members asked for additional time to review the document and the Chair asked that people send in any comments or feedback so they can vote on the next call.
- **Confidential Business Information (CBI) draft proposal (TF).** Members discussed the two possible positions for the NOSB regarding CBI: 1) They could omit CBI from the petition guidelines or 2) They could continue to allow CBI and amend the current guidelines to address issues with CBI. For example, they could request a complete list of materials but not necessarily the recipe. This would help the board determine if a material had undergone a chemical change during the manufacturing process, which is basic information necessary to make a determination, without giving away trade secrets or proprietary information. The general consensus is to not allow CBI in petitions. The group discussed how to present this proposal at the meeting, and the chair felt it should be presented separate from the update to the petition and TR process proposal so people can comment on each one individually. The group proceeded to a vote so they could send it to the PDS for review.

#### **Vote:**

Motion to accept the revision to the material petition process eliminating the provision for Confidential Business Information.

Motion by: TF

Seconded by: JFe

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- Research Priorities progress report (JT) – The Chair noted that the Research Priorities Framework was written specifically to address items that have already been considered by NOSB and was not intended for brand new items. The Crops Subcommittee is working on a list of research priorities which they will discuss further before sending to the MS. The Handling Subcommittee discussed this on their last call, and ZS will present the list on the next MS call. The Livestock Subcommittee has not discussed this yet but the LS Chair will add it to the July 30 call agenda. The GMO ad hoc Subcommittee will be discussing research priorities later this week. A member asked about the status of the research priorities letter they prepared and sent after the last NOSB meeting and would like to get an update from Mark Lipson. A member told the group that NEPA has listening sessions that they may be interested in attending. He will find out the schedule and let everyone know. The NOP asked the Subcommittee to consider citrus degreening disease for possible inclusion

in the list of research priorities, and acknowledged that this topic is not related to other specific NOSB workplan items.

- Update the petition and TR process (ZS). ZS sent new draft doc, which includes comments by JFe. The first part of the document pertains to the Federal Register Notice portion and the second part pertains to the PPM. The group discussed various edits that were made to the document beginning with 'Information to include in a petition'. LB will send some language to ZS regarding brand name products. ZS will ask JFe for clarification on the need to include "mode of action" for petitioned handling materials. The members also discussed whether or not to include a link to the petition guidelines or place the text directly in the PPM. The NOP supported a link, which will make updates easier to manage. ZS asked that the group suggest edits for the last paragraph so they can discuss it on the next call.

#### **Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

July 23, 2013 1:00 pm ET

CBI draft proposal (TF) - completed

Defining Production Aids (JFe)

Research Priorities (JT)

August 13, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Definition of Production Aids (JFe) - vote

Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB) – Discuss edits/Vote(?)

Research Priorities (JT) - Discuss Subcommittee lists

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date         |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013      |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013     |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | September 11, 2013  |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | September 13, 2013  |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | September 23, 2013  |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 22-24, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, August 13, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Mac Stone (MS) sitting in, Joe Dickson (JD)

**Absent:** Wendy Fulwider (WF), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Calvin Walker (CW)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project  | Contact | Status  | Vote     | Meeting            |
|--|---------|---|----------|--------------------|
| Update petition and TR process – Confidential Business Information (CBI)     | TF      |   | 07 23 13 | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Update petition and TR process - Misc topics                                 | ZS/LB   | Misc edits from LB  | 08 13 13 | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe     |   | 08 13 13 | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a> | JT      | Subcommittee reps to MS<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS<br><br>JT? ZS? - GMO ad hoc |          | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA       | N/A                |
| How to address scientific uncertainty  | JFe     | Will begin this after “Update Petition Process and CBI projects” are complete       |          | TBD                |

**Agenda:**

- Review/approve the notes from July 23
- Definition of Production Aids (JFe) – vote
- Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB) – Discuss edits/Vote(?)
- Research Priorities (JT) - Discuss Subcommittee lists

**Discussion:**



- Notes of July 23 approved with no changes.
- MA made a couple of edits to the table above removing two items that are no longer workplan items. (Classification of Materials Guidance and Update to the petition and TR process - (Convening of technical advisory boards &/or working group policy))
- **Definition of Production Aids (JFe)** – A member noted that after further thought, this new definition is not broad enough to encompass such things as MgO, which is used as a processing aid in a crop input, and feels that the definition should remain as is. The group discussed whether or not there would be any confusion between ancillary substances and production aids and felt that if not then this proposal is not necessary. A member felt that if MgO had been petitioned as a production aid it would have been more nebulous and less clear to which another member indicated that it is not necessary to get that specific. A member asked why the word synthetic was inserted in the text, and felt that because this section of the National List is for synthetics it's redundant. The Subcommittee chose to vote now and leave the vote open for absent members. The vote will close on the August 27 call.

#### **Vote on Definition of Production Aids**

Motion to add the following to §205.2 Terms defined:

Production aid. A physical item used in production, but not leaving any residue in the aquatic or terrestrial ecosystem; or a chemical substance used on equipment, but not used on crops or livestock. Production aids do not include substances taken up by plants or chemicals dispersed into soil, water, air, or on plant surfaces.

Motion by: JFe

Seconded by: JD

Discussion: none

Yes: 1 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

4 others will vote via email. JFe will make some minor edits to the document and resend it to the group for voting purposes.

- **Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB).** Members discussed various edits to the petition guideline updates which ZS will incorporate. They also discussed how best to illustrate the old and new text, and chose to strike out the old text and underline the new text.

#### **Vote on Update Petition and TR process**

Motion to accept the revised proposal on the Update petition and TR process as presented August 13

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: TF

Discussion: none

Yes: 4 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: Recuse: 0

3 others will vote via email. ZS will prepare the finalized document and circulate it to the group.

#### **ABS note :**

- **Research Priorities progress report (JT)** - Three Subcommittees (LS, CS and HS) sent lists to the Materials Subcommittee, who will review and prioritize topics on next call. The GMO ad hoc

Subcommittee suggested the following two topics: What happens to GMO materials in compost, and can GMOs be bred out of lines? The list might be increased after Thursdays GMO ad hoc call. The LS wanted to add one more topic: salmonella in pastured poultry. ML noted that the NOSB should post a document not a letter, which includes a link to objectives.

#### **Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

August 13, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Definition of Production Aids (JFe) - vote

Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB) – Discuss edits/Vote(?)

Research Priorities (JT) - Discuss Subcommittee lists

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Research Priorities (JT) - Discuss Subcommittee lists

Definition of Production Aids (JFe) – complete vote

Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB) – Complete Vote

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date         |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013      |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013     |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | September 11, 2013  |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | September 13, 2013  |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | September 23, 2013  |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 22-24, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, August 27, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Wendy Fulwider (WF), Joe Dickson (JD), Mac Stone (MS) sitting in

**Absent:** Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Calvin Walker (CW)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project  | Contact | Status  | Vote     | Meeting            |
|--|---------|---|----------|--------------------|
| Update petition and TR process – Confidential Business Information (CBI)     | TF      |   | 07 23 13 | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Update petition and TR process - Misc topics                                 | ZS/LB   | Misc edits from LB  | 08 13 13 | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe     |   | 08 13 13 | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a> | JT      | Subcommittee reps to MS<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS<br><br>JT? ZS? - GMO ad hoc |          | Proposal Fall 2013 |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA       | N/A                |
| How to address scientific uncertainty  | JFe     | Will begin this after “Update Petition Process and CBI projects” are complete       |          | TBD                |

**Agenda:**

- Review/approve the notes from August 13, 2013
- Research Priorities (JT) - Discuss Subcommittee lists
- Definition of Production Aids (JFe) – complete vote
- Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB) – Complete Vote

#### Discussion:

- Notes of August 13 were approved with no changes.
- **Definition of Production Aids (JFe).** The vote, opened on August 13, was completed. See below for final tally.

Motion to add the following to §205.2 Terms defined:

Production aid. A physical item used in production, but not leaving any residue in the aquatic or terrestrial ecosystem; or a chemical substance used on equipment, but not used on crops or livestock. Production aids do not include substances taken up by plants or chemicals dispersed into soil, water, air, or on plant surfaces.

Motion by: JFe

Seconded by: JD

Discussion: none

Yes: 5 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0 (JT voted via phone 08 28 13 and the tally was changed to reflect that )

- **Update Petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB).** The vote, opened on August 13, was completed. See below for final tally.

Motion to accept the revised proposal on the Update Petition and TR Process as presented August 13

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: TF

Discussion: none

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0 (JT voted via phone 08 28 13 and the tally was changed to reflect that )

- **Research Priorities (JT)** - ZS sent an email after the last call requesting that members vote on their top 10 priorities in an effort to prioritize them on today's call. Members discussed the topics and compiled a list of 10 priorities. A member asked how this list would be disseminated to the researchers, and the NOP indicated that it would be sent to groups and agencies within the USDA such as the USDA Organic Working Group and the Agricultural Research Service. In light of that the group discussed how specific and detailed they have to be if the topics are going to be distributed to groups. ZS will make some final edits and submit the document to the NOP ASAP with the acknowledgement that the Subcommittee could reformat or make copy edits before they submit the final recommendation in October. The final list was comprised of topics that were most fleshed out and had the most support.

Motion to adopt the research priorities as presented August 27

Motion by: ZS

Seconded by: TF

Discussion: none

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0 (JT voted via phone 08 28 13)

- The meeting was adjourned

#### Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:

August 13, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Definition of Production Aids (JFe) - vote

Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB) – Discuss edits/Vote(?)

Research Priorities (JT) - Discuss Subcommittee lists

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Research Priorities (JT) - Discuss Subcommittee lists-done

Definition of Production Aids (JFe) – complete vote-done

Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB) – Complete Vote-done

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Workplans

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date         |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013      |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013     |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | September 11, 2013  |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | September 13, 2013  |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | September 23, 2013  |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 22-24, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, September 10, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Mac Stone (MS) sitting in, John Foster (JFo) - sitting in

**Absent:** Wendy Fulwider (WF), Joe Dickson (JD), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Calvin Walker (CW)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project  | Contact | Status  | Vote     | Meeting  |
|--|---------|---|----------|--|
| Update petition and TR process – Confidential Business Information (CBI)     | TF      |   | 07 23 13 | Proposal Fall 2013   |
| Update petition and TR process - Misc topics                                 | ZS/LB   | Misc edits from LB  | 08 13 13 | Proposal Fall 2013   |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe     |   | 08 13 13 | *Proposal Fall 2013. Item was pulled off the fall 2013 agenda by the NOP |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a> | JT      | Subcommittee reps to MS<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS<br><br>JT? ZS? - GMO ad hoc | 08 27 13 | Proposal Fall 2013   |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA       | N/A  |
| How to address scientific uncertainty  | JFe     | Will begin this after “Update Petition Process and CBI projects” are complete       |          | TBD  |

**Agenda:**

- Review/approve the notes from August 27, 2013

**Discussion:**

- Due to lack of quorum, approval of the notes from August 27 were delayed until the next call, September 24, 2013
- The group briefly discussed the removal of the Definition of Production Aids from the fall agenda. ZS noted that she was going to bring this topic up on the Executive call Friday, September 13 so they can have this conversation with the Executive Subcommittee and the Deputy Administrator. Members questioned why the document was pulled off of the agenda at such a late stage in the process and not sooner. The NOP indicated that occasionally it's difficult to know what the outcome of a document is until it is close to finished. Members discussed ways to prevent this from happening, such as completing the documents sooner so the NOP had time to review them thoroughly, and making sure that the technical representatives that are participating on the calls are communicating with the NOP administrator. The group expressed an interest in adding this topic to the ES call this Friday.
- Members discussed adding two possible items to the workplan for 2014: a document on biodiversity and a document on addressing scientific uncertainty. The Subcommittee chair noted that biodiversity might be better suited for the Crops Subcommittee. JFe will circulate a short summary that he drafted previously regarding "how to address scientific uncertainty" to submit with the tentative workplan before Friday's Executive call.
- The Chair relayed to the group the idea of reducing the number of Materials Subcommittee calls to once a month since the 2014 MS workplan will be light.

#### **Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

August 27, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Research Priorities (JT) - Discuss Subcommittee lists-done

Definition of Production Aids (JFe) – complete vote-done

Update petition and TR process - Misc (ZS/LB) – Complete Vote-done

September 10, 2013 1:00 pm ET

Workplans

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date        |
|--|--------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013     |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013    |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013  |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | September 11, 2013 |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | September 13, 2013 |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | September 23, 2013 |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013    |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013   |

|   |                     |
|---|---------------------|
| Workplans finalized on ES call          | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY | October 22-24, 2013 |



Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, September 24, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Mac Stone (MS) sitting in Joe Dickson (JD), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Calvin Walker (CW)

**Absent:** Tracy Favre (TF), Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan**

| Project  | Contact | Status  | Vote     | Meeting  |
|--|---------|---|----------|--|
| Update petition and TR process – Confidential Business Information (CBI)     | TF      |   | 07 23 13 | Proposal Fall 2013   |
| Update petition and TR process -Misc topics                                  | ZS/LB   | Misc edits from LB  | 08 13 13 | Proposal Fall 2013   |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe     |   | 08 13 13 | *Proposal Fall 2013. Item was pulled off the fall 2013 agenda by the NOP |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a> | JT      | Subcommittee reps to MS<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS<br><br>JT? ZS? - GMO ad hoc | 08 27 13 | Proposal Fall 2013   |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA       | N/A  |
| How to address scientific uncertainty  | JFe     | May begin this after “Update Petition Process and CBI projects” are complete        |          | TBD  |

**Agenda:**

- Review/approve the notes from August 27, 2013
- Review/approve the notes from September 10, 2013
- Workplan potential items: Biodiversity and Scientific Uncertainty
- Public comments

**Discussion:**

- Notes from August 27, 2013 approved with no changes
- Notes from September 10, 2013 approved with no changes
- Biodiversity. The group talked briefly about placing this item on the CACS workplan. During the last Executive call, MB noted that the NOP is also working on this and would like to talk about the specifics of the document so they are not duplicating work.
- JFe noted that questions pertaining to biodiversity were inadvertently omitted from the materials review checklist for Crops, and ZS asked that JFe send an email to the NOP as well as the Chair of the Handling Subcommittee regarding its revision. This may be handled as a housekeeping item rather than as a separate proposal.
- Scientific uncertainty. The group discussed this item as a potential workplan item. The intent of the document would be to provide guidance about issues, identify sources, such as peer reviewed studies, and include a discussion of how the Board weighs information from various sources. This could also serve to provide transparency for the public about how the process works. Several members felt that this was such a large-scale topic that there is no meaningful way for the Materials Subcommittee to undertake this as a workplan item. The Chair noted that this might be better as a report or guidance within the New Member guide as opposed to a proposal. The NOP also feels that the scope is too broad.. The NOP noted that the Board was not created as a scientific review Board, but as a body that would represent various organic stakeholders. NOP provides resources for technical reports to provide scientific information in non-scientific language for use by the NOSB.
- The NOP updated the group about several materials that have been submitted for review: Whole Algalin Flour (205.606), L-Methionine (205.605) and Fragrances (205.605). These petitions are still under review by the NOP. NOP answered a question about NOSB review of personal care product petitions.
- The group discussed adding a workplan item, or submitting a petition about prohibiting BPA in organic packaging. LB noted that packaging is not under the purview of the National List, but is addressed elsewhere in the regulations. The Chair noted that while it's not a National List Item, it is analogous to prohibited items in crops (materials, practices, etc). Members feel that this is a good idea, although reviewing one packaging material could potentially lead to many others that would need to be reviewed as well. The NOP suggested that perhaps this could be undertaken as a two-stage process; a discussion document then a proposal. The Chair suggested adding this to the Handling Subcommittees workplan for 2014, perhaps fall, not spring.
- The group will discuss the public comment on next call as well as who is presenting what at the fall 2013 meeting.
- After the fall meeting the Materials Subcommittee will eliminate one conference call per month.
- A member asked if the others felt the NOP response as to why Production Aids proposal was removed from the agenda was satisfactory or if they would like a more thorough justification. Many felt that they do not understand the reasoning and would like to discuss this further with the Deputy Administrator.

**Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

September 24, 2013 1:00 pm ET

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET

November 12, 2013 1:00 ET

November 26, 2013 1:00 ET

December 10, 2013 1:00

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date         |
|--|---------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013      |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013     |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013   |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | September 11, 2013  |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | September 13, 2013  |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | September 23, 2013  |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013     |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013    |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | October 11, 2013    |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | October 22-24, 2013 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)  
Materials Subcommittee (MS) Meeting Notes  
Tuesday, November 12, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Zea Sonnabend (Chair) (ZS), Jay Feldman (JFe), Tracy Favre (TF), Mac Stone (MS) - sitting in

**Absent:** Joe Dickson (JD), Jennifer Taylor (JT) (Vice Chair), Calvin Walker (CW), Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB)

**Work Plan** (Will be replaced with updated version after November Executive Call)

| Project  | Contact | Status  | Vote     | Meeting  |
|--|---------|---|----------|--|
| Update petition and TR process<br>– Confidential Business<br>Information (CBI) | TF      |   | 07 23 13 | Proposal Fall<br>2013<br><br>Meeting<br>cancelled  |
| Update petition and TR process<br>-Misc topics                                 | ZS/LB   | Misc edits from LB  | 08 13 13 | Proposal Fall<br>2013<br><br>Meeting<br>cancelled  |
| Definition of production aids  | JFe     |   | 08 13 13 | *Proposal<br>Fall 2013.<br>Item was<br>removed<br>from the fall<br>2013 agenda<br>by the NOP |
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a>   | JT      | Subcommittee reps to MS<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS<br><br>JT? ZS? - GMO ad hoc | 08 27 13 | Proposal Fall<br>2013<br><br>Meeting<br>cancelled  |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB   | Ongoing   | NA       | N/A  |
| How to address scientific<br>uncertainty                                       | JFe     | May begin this after “Update<br>Petition Process and CBI projects”<br>are complete  |          | TBD  |

**Agenda:**

- Review/approve the notes from September 24, 2013
- Discuss public comments received for Louisville and/or postpone this to a date we choose.
- Set winter call schedule
- Review workplan
- Other business

**Discussion:**

- Notes from September 24, 2013 approved with no changes
- The Subcommittee will discuss the public comments for the fall 2013 proposals on the December 10 call.
- Winter call schedule. The Subcommittee is going to reduce the number of calls from two a month to one based on the reduced workplan. The chair proposed keeping the 2nd Tuesday and eliminating the 4th Tuesdays. MA will send a calendar update.
- Workplans:
  - The MS Chair would like the members to work on Research Priorities all year and to keep the conversation at the forefront.
  - The Livestock Chair noted that the Research Priorities list from the LS was very long and they have proposed to narrow it and provide more specificity about some of the items. They will resubmit the list to the MS when it is complete.
  - The Chair indicated that the MS will likely not rewrite and reissue the Research Priorities Proposal, but will discuss this further on the December 10 call.
- Other business
  - Biodiversity. The group discussed the status of amendments to the materials checklists that address biodiversity. The checklists have been updated and MA will distribute to the group.
  - The NOP has a guidance document on biodiversity that is under development. The guidance will implement a previous NOSB recommendation on biodiversity.
  - Ancillary substances. There was a question about the status of the ancillary substances work. This work is being done within the Handling Subcommittee. An update will be provided at the February NOSB training.
- The workplan table has been updated with the 2014 workplan items and will replace the one above in the next set of notes. Additionally, a 2014 milestone timeline has been added below and will replace the fall 2013 milestones.

**Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

October 8, 2013 1:00 pm ET (CANCELLED)

November 12, 2013 1:00 ET

November 26, 2013 1:00 ET – cancelled

December 10, 2013 1:00 ET

Review public comments from fall 2013 proposals

January 14, 2014 1:00 ET

February 11, 2014 1:00 ET

March 11, 2014 1:00 ET

April 8, 2014 1:00 ET

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

| Fall 2013 Milestones                                   | Target date        |
|--|--------------------|
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                        | August 9, 2013     |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                         | August 27, 2013    |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment | September 3, 2013  |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP        | September 11, 2013 |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                           | September 13, 2013 |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB     | September 23, 2013 |
| Public comment closes                                  | October 1, 2013    |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB            | ~October 7, 2013   |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                         | CANCELLED          |
| Fall 2013 NOSB Meeting – Louisville, KY                | CANCELLED          |

| Spring 2014 Milestones   | Target date          |
|--|----------------------|
| Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances | Jan 15, 2014         |
| NOSB Training meeting  | Feb 4 - 5, 2014      |
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                                    | Feb 7, 2014          |
| Fall 2013 proposals due to NOP                                     | Feb 26, 2014         |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment             | Mar 10, 2014         |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP                    | Mar 12, 2014         |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                                       | Mar 14, 2014         |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB                 | Mar 28, 2014         |
| Public comment closes  | Apr 8, 2014          |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                                     | Apr 11, 2014         |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                        | Apr 14, 2014         |
| Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX                         | ~Apr 28- May 1, 2014 |

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**  
**Materials/GMO ad hoc Subcommittee Meeting Notes**  
**Tuesday, December 10, 2013, 1:00 pm ET**

**Attending:** Calvin Walker, Chair (CW), Zea Sonnabend (ZS), Jennifer Taylor (JT), Nick Maravell (NM), Francis Thicke (FT), Jay Feldman (JF) - sitting in

**Absent:** Wendy Fulwider (WF)

**Staff:** Michelle Arsenault (MA), Lisa Brines (LB), Mark Lipson (ML)

**Work Plan**

| Materials Projects   | Contact  | Notes   | Vote     | Meeting            |
|--|----------|---|----------|--------------------|
| Research Priorities Proposals<br><a href="#">May 2012 Framework Proposal</a> | JT       | Subcommittee reps to MS<br><br>WF-LS<br>JFe-CS<br>ZS-HS<br><br>JT? ZS? - GMO ad hoc | 08 27 13 | Fall 2014          |
| Petition and TR tracking   | ZS/LB    | Ongoing   | NA       | N/A                |
| GMO Projects   | Contact  | Notes   | Vote     | Meeting            |
| Seed Purity  | ZS/JFe   | Written Report  |          | Report<br>Spr 2014 |
| Terminology for Excluded Methods (formerly Plant Breeding)                   | ZS       | Discussion Doc  |          | Spr 2014           |
| Prevention Strategy Guidance for Excluded Methods in Crops and Handling      | JFe, CBo | ZS will write a briefing document for the NOP<br><br>Discussion doc                 |          | TBD                |
| Tracing GMOs in Input/Ingredient Chain                                       |          | ZS will write a briefing document for the NOP<br><br>Discussion doc                 |          | TBD                |

**Agenda:**

- Chairperson Note (CW)
- Vice Chair Announcement (CW)
- Approve Materials notes from November 12, 2013

- Approve GMO ad hoc notes from November 14, 2013
- Work Plan Items (Materials) Update (ZS)
- Work Plan Items (GMO ad hoc) Update (JT)
- Seed Purity Update (ZS)
- Research Priorities Public Comment (CW)
- Other matters

#### **Discussion:**

- The MS/GMO ad hoc Chairperson asked that the Subcommittee members send out draft work documents at least a week ahead of time if they can, so people have enough time to review them before the calls. He added that his intention is to keep the meetings concise and maximize the conversation time to be more efficient since the Subcommittee will be meeting only once a month.
- CW appointed ZS as Vice Chair for the Subcommittee.
- Notes from the November 12, 2013 Materials call approved without changes.
- Notes from the November 14, 2013 GMO ad hoc call approved without changes.
- Work Plan Items (Materials) Update (ZS). The “Update TR and Petition Process” proposal that was supposed to be presented at the fall 2013 will go forth to the spring 2014 meeting with no revisions.
- Work Plan Items (GMO ad hoc) Update (JT). There are two projects planned for the spring 2014 NOSB meeting: The Seed Purity document will be edited and put forth as a report and the Terminology for Excluded Methods will be a discussion document. The group would like to work on several other projects and will write briefing papers to submit to the NOP. The other projects include Transgene Flow, Tracing GMOs in the Input Ingredient Chain, and Farmer’s Choice. JT will write the briefing documents.
- Seed Purity Update (ZS) – The lead reviewer provided some background about the Seed Purity document since it is new to several members. The ideas proposed in the original document were not enforceable by the USDA so the NOP asked that the document structure be changed to that of a report instead of a proposal. The goal for this report is to gather public comment about possible funding mechanisms for the polluters. Despite revising the document the NOP did not approve it for inclusion on the fall 2013 meeting agenda, so ZS and ML continue to make revisions with input from the other Subcommittee members. The group is now awaiting feedback from the NOP. Since the Materials Subcommittee will only meet once a month, ZS asked that people send any comments via email, and the group will discuss the document on the January 14 call.
- A member reminded the group that the comment period for the AC21 re: Coexistence among GE and non-GE producers is open until the beginning of January and urged the members to submit comments. After the last call it was determined that the Subcommittee could not submit comments as a body, but members could submit personal comments.
- Research Priorities public comment (CW) - CW sent a summary of the comments to the group prior to the call. Members noted that they found the comments very helpful, but will submit these research priorities for the spring 2014 meeting without revision.
- Other matters
  - Members briefly discussed the Confidential Business Information document and will continue the discussion on January 14 about whether to revise it for the spring 2014 meeting. CW volunteered to summarize public comment but based on an initial assessment it didn’t seem like revisions were necessary.



- For simplicity, the new hybrid Subcommittee (Materials plus GMO ad hoc) will simply be referred to as the “Materials Subcommittee” and will be reflected in the next set of notes.
- JT asked about the possibility of the MS providing a report/summary of their prior work to the NOSB Chair and to the program (e.g., during Executive call time) to inform other Subcommittee about issues they are working on.

#### **Future Scheduled Subcommittee Calls:**

December 10, 2013 1:00 ET

January 14, 2014 1:00 ET

Seed Purity Update (ZS)

CBI - discuss comments

February 11, 2014 1:00 ET

March 11, 2014 1:00 ET

April 8, 2014 1:00 ET

May 13, 2014 1:00 ET

| Spring 2014 Milestones   | Target date          |
|--|----------------------|
| Subcommittee requests technical reports for Sunset 2016 substances | Jan 15, 2014         |
| NOSB Training meeting  | Feb 4 - 5, 2014      |
| NOP – Complete tentative agenda                                    | Feb 7, 2014          |
| Spring 2014 proposals due to NOP                                   | Feb 26, 2014         |
| NOP - Post proposals, Publish FRN, Open public comment             | Mar 10, 2014         |
| Subcommittees submit tentative workplans to NOP                    | Mar 12, 2014         |
| Discuss workplans on ES call                                       | Mar 14, 2014         |
| NOP provides written comments on workplans to NOSB                 | Mar 28, 2014         |
| Public comment closes  | Apr 8, 2014          |
| Workplans finalized on ES call                                     | Apr 11, 2014         |
| NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB                        | Apr 14, 2014         |
| Spring 2014 NOSB Meeting – San Antonio, TX                         | ~Apr 28- May 1, 2014 |